

EAST AFRICAN COMMUNITY

MEETING OF SOCIAL SECURITY EXPERTS ON THE CO-ORDINATION OF SOCIAL SECURITY SYSTEMS WITHIN AN EAC COMMON MARKET

11th – 13th June 2018 KAMPALA, UGANDA

REPORT OF THE MEETING Ref: EAC/SSE/L&E/01/2018

EAC Secretariat, Arusha, Tanzania. June 2018

From P

 \propto

A CH

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The meeting of the Social Security experts on coordination of social security systems in an EAC Common Market framework was held from 11th- 13th June 2018, in Kampala-Uganda in accordance with the EAC Calendar of Activities, for the period January to June 2018. The meeting was convened by the EAC Secretariat in collaboration with International Labour Organisation (ILO).

1.1 Background to the meeting

In Article 14 (3) (d) of the Treaty for Establishment of the EAC, the Council is expected to make regulations, issue directives, take decisions and give opinions in accordance with the provisions of the Treaty. Article 10(3) (f) of the EAC Common Market Protocol, entitles a worker to enjoy the rights and benefits of social security as accorded to the workers of the host Partner State.

Article 12 (2) of the Protocol, states that "The Partner States undertake to review and harmonize their national social security policies, laws and systems to provide for social security for self-employed persons who are citizens of other Partner States". The implementation of Article 12 shall be in accordance with Council directives and regulations.

In an effort to operationalise the above stated provisions on social security benefits, at its 4th sitting held from 22nd – 6th November 2009, the Forum of Ministers of Labour and Employment adopted a Model Annex for use to develop the draft Council Directive on the Coordination of Social Security systems. A number of social security experts meetings were held in collaboration with the International Labour Organisation (ILO) and a draft Council Directive on the coordination of social security systems in the EAC was developed.

The draft Directive was presented to a Multi-Sectoral Council of Ministers on the EAC Common Market held in February 2011, Bujumbura- Burundi for consideration. The meeting did not endorse the draft directive due to diversity of social security policies and legal frameworks existing in the Partner States, and recommended that an actuarial study be undertaken. The decision of Multi-sectoral Council meeting was upheld by the 22nd Council of Ministers meeting held in April 2011. Accordingly, the Council directed the Secretariat to hire a Consultant by 30th June 2011 to consolidate the various actuarial studies undertaken by the Partner States Social Security institutions to address among other issues, the financial and economic implications on the coordination of Social Security benefits, taking into account the current systems, policies and laws in the Partner States (EAC CM/22/Directive 68 refers).

It is therefore against the above background that the EAC Secretariat in collaboration with ILO, convened a meeting of social security experts from 11th-13th June 2018, to among others; consider the status of policy and legal frameworks existing in Partner

From 4

 χ^2

M

States and determine the way forward on coordination of social security systems within the EAC Common Market framework.

1.2 Participation of the meeting

The meeting was attended by experts drawn from the Ministries of EAC Affairs, Labour, Attorneys General /constitutional Affairs, Bureau of Statistics, national social security funds and regulatory authorities. The meeting was also attended by representatives from the East Africa Employers' Organisation (EAEO), East African Trade Union Confederation (EATUC), East and Central Africa Social Security Association (ECASSA) and social security experts from ILO. The list of participants is hereto attached as **Annex I**.

1.3 Constitution of the Bureau

In accordance with the EAC Rules and Procedures, the meeting was Chaired by Ms Florence Alarango, Principal Gender Officer, Ministry of EAC Affairs, Republic of Uganda, while Ms Ruranganwa Diane, Head of Department, Rwanda Social Security Board, Republic of Rwanda was the *Rapporteur*.

1.4 Adoption of the Agenda

The agenda was adopted with amendments and is hereto attached as Annex II.

1.5 Opening Remarks

1.5.1 Remarks by the Chairperson

The Chairperson welcomed the Partner States' delegates to the meeting. She thanked the EAC Secretariat and ILO for facilitating the meeting that had taken over 5 years without being convened. The Chairperson noted that under labour subsector, a number of achievements had been registered such as harmonisation of work permit application forms and procedures, abolition or reduction of residence/ work permit fees, with little progress under social security initiative. She therefore, emphasized that the social security experts' meeting was very timely and critical because social security, is one of the facilitators to labour mobility in the community.

She informed the meeting that, despite lack of a regional mechanism to allow portability of social security in the community, free movement of labour was being realised with the implementation of the EAC Common Market protocol. However, the delayed adoption of Council Directive on coordination of social security had undermined the full realisation of the freedom of movement of labour. The Chairperson was therefore, optimistic that with the signing of the revised EAC/ILO MoU, on 9th May 2018, the areas of cooperation on coordination of Social Security Benefits would be fast-tracked

She wished the meeting successful deliberations

 $\vec{<}$

1.5.2 Remarks by the ILO

A٨

Mr Wellington Chibebe, ILO Director, ILO Country Office for Tanzania, Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda and Uganda, expressed pleasure to be part of the social security experts' meeting. He said the meeting was in line with principle of promoting and strengthening Decent Work in the sub-region particularly through the extension of social security benefits to migrants and their families. He also emphasized the importance of the meeting, adding that, it was very timely being the first joint activity implementing the recently signed Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with the EAC on 9th May 2018. The MoU outlines the framework for cooperation between the ILO and the EAC and social security is one of the five areas of cooperation provided in Article II of the MoU.

He also said that, the ILO is honoured and privileged to have been part of the process of implementing of the EAC Common Market provisions on social security through the ILO projects on "Extending social security access and portability to migrant workers and their families through selected RECs in Africa" funded by the European Commission.

He clarified that the project will support the EAC Secretariat, Partner States and the Social Partners in the sub-region towards the realization of a regional coordination and protection framework to improve migrant workers access and portability of social protection in the EAC. The EAC component of the project aims at enhancing EAC's capacity and knowledge base to advance the regional coordination and protection framework to improve migrant workers access to social protection.

He pledged commitment by ILO in strengthening its collaboration with the EAC Secretariat, EAC Partner States and sub-regional groups of social partners, towards the realisation of social security for migrant workers and their families in the community.

He wished the meeting fruitful deliberations

1.5.3 Remarks by the EAC Secretariat.

Ms. Mary Makoffu, Director–Social Sectors, EAC Secretariat, welcomed the Partner States' delegations to Kampala and to the meeting. She thanked ILO for the continued technical and financial support to the EAC Secretariat in the areas for of coordination of social security and other areas of cooperation as contained under EAC/ILO MoU, 2001 that has been reviewed and updated to include other areas of employment creation. The Director also commended, EATUC, EAEO and ECASSA for undertaking various studies focussed on recommendations on the way forward about the coordination of social security systems.

Fron p

4

Ms Makoffu noted that the quest to actualize the provisions of the Treaty and the EAC CMP and to facilitate the movement of labour in the Community started with the adoption of the Post Common Market Protocol Negotiation Programme in 2009. Therefore, the initiative to develop the Social Security Annex/Directive was part of the road map towards the completion of the pending Annexes of the EAC CMP.

With the support from the ILO a draft Directive on the Coordination of Social Security benefits was developed and presented to the Multi-Sectoral Council of Ministers on the negotiation of the EAC CMP for consideration. The Draft Directive was not endorsed due to diversity of policy and legal frameworks existing in Partners States by then. The multi- sectoral council recommended to the EAC Council to direct the EAC Secretariat to hire a consultant to consolidate the various actuarial studies undertaken by the Partner States social security institutions. This directive was not implemented to date due to budgetary challenges.

The Director concluded her remarks by thanking the dialogue partners for the work-undertaken in the area of coordination of social security benefits and the ILO for the new project which will facilitate the EAC Secretariat and Partner States to initiate a new phase in the preparation of the draft Directive on Social Security.

She wished the meeting fruitful deliberations.

2.0 CONSIDERATION OF THE STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF COUNCIL DIRECTIVES/DECISIONS UNDER SOCIAL SECURITY

The meeting considered the status of implementation of previous decisions/recommendations made by the Fourth Forum of Ministers Responsible for Labour and Employment held in November 2009; the 19th Meeting of Council of Ministers held on 18th November 2009; The 22nd Meeting of Council of Ministers held on 11 April 2011; and the 27th Meeting of the Sectoral Council of Ministers responsible for EAC Affairs and Planning held on 3rd November 2017.

The Summary of updated status of Implementation of the decisions and directives is reflected in the table below

Horom 4

5.

n M

2.1 Summary of the status of Implementation of the fourth Meeting of the Forum of Ministers Responsible for Labour and Employment held on 6th November 2009

10.7	7	
	Decisions	Status of Implementation
1	The Ministers:- endorsed and adopted the Model Draft Annex on social security as a working document and requested the social	The; (EAC/CIVITIBI Decision 51
	security experts to finalize the document.	Model Draft Annex on social security was expected to expedite the development of the necessary regulations and schedules for the coordination of social security
		benefits in an EAC CMP in line with post- negotiation activities of the EAC CM.
2	urged Partner States to develop a national policy on social security in line with social security (Minimum Standards)	has national social protection
	Convention (No. 102, 1952) of the ILO	policy that is line with C.102 of 1952. The country has initiated
		ratification of the Convention. Other related policies such as Diaspora and National Employment Policy and Strategy are in place.
		United Republic of Tanzania: The country is process of reviewing the Social security
		Policy 2003, in line with ILO Ștandards. There is also Zanzibar Social Protection Policy 2014.
		Republic of Rwanda: There exists a Social Security Policy 2009 and Social Health
		Policy, 2015 that comply with ILO Standards. Republic of Burundi:
		A Social Protection Policy and strategy have been respectively developed in 2011 and 2014 were
-	Λ .	

From P

6

K ### urged Partner States to ensure that the social security concept addresses the extension of coverage, type and adequacy of the benefits, portability of benefits within States and across borders, affordability of the social security schemes, financing, management and supervision, regulatory framework for the sector, co-ordination and consideration of social security as a constitutional right and a responsibility of the State.

developed. There is Natior Social Protection Commission habeen set up to oversee the implementation of the policy.

Republic of Uganda:

The country adopted Soci Protection Policy, 2015 and toc effect from November 2016. The policy provides for the institution mechanisms include the information and portability of benefits

Republic of South Sudan:

Reviewing the social security sector in line with ILO internations standards

Tanzania:

Social security extension strategy 1997-2018. Reviewing the socia policies to security address coverage and adequacy Act No.8 2008 was benefits. enacted regulate to Socia Security Sector. Article 11 of the constitution provides for state responsibility. Conditional cash transfers to poor families through TASAF. Voluntary Schemes to carter for the informal sector:

Zanzibar paying universal pension to persons aged 70 years and above

Kenya:

NSSF Act 45 2013, provides for extension of coverage for the formal and informal sector adequacy and portability of benefits. The Constitution entrenches social security benefits as a constitutional right.

Extension of coverage to include persons with disabilities, old age

Jack of

 $\overset{7}{\sim}$

A. THE

(70 years and above) ar bursaries

In 2013, three bilaters agreements negotiated with UAE Saudi Arabia and Qatar als negotiating additional agreement with Kuwait, Lebanon and Oman.

Uganda:

Survivors, invalidity benefits and midterm access. Voluntary and terminal benefits URBRA 2011, institutional framework that regulates the sector.

Burundi:

Free health care for children under 5 years and free maternity care are in place since 2006.

Tree mandatory institutions are in place for the formal sector: INSS and ONPR for pension sector, MFP for health care.

A regulator is in place since 2013 called SEP/CNP.

A non-contributory scheme is being set up for vulnerable families in collaboration with the World Bank.

Rwanda:

Increased minimum pension benefits Health scheme that provides health benefits to the informal sector. In 2015, another Scheme developed with maternity leave provided. Different bilateral agreements with Burundi and Congo DRC under negotiation.

Fram o

*

4	requested the Council to adopt the developed roadmap and timeframe in order to expedite the development of the necessary regulations and schedules for the coordination of social security benefits in an EAC Common Market.	recommendations of the 4 th Forum
5	directed the Secretariat to work in collaboration with the ILO to develop a schedule on Totalization of Benefits and Administrative Assistance for consideration by the EAC Council.	•

2.2 Summary of the status of Implementation the Council and Sectoral Council of Ministers responsible for EAC Affairs and Planning (SCMEAP)

1 %	S Decisions N Number.	Decision/directive	Status of Implementation
	(EAC CM /22 Decision 58)	referred all unfinished business on coordination of social security benefits to the Forum of Ministers responsible for Social Security.	.
2	(EAC CM/ 22 directive 68).	The Council directed the Secretariat to hire a consultant to consolidate the various actuarial studies undertaken by social security organizations, to address among others the financial and economic implications on the coordination of social security study benefits taking into account the current systems, policies and laws in the Partner States.	budgetary constraints. The EAC Secretariat is in process of getting support from ILO to undertake the study.
3	EAC/CM/22/direc tive 70)	The Council directed the Republic of Rwanda and the United Republic of Tanzania to submit copies of their national social security legislation to the EAC Secretariat by 30 th April 2011 to facilitate the study.	Implemented. (Partner States may submit recently enacted legislations (if arry).
4	EAC CM/ 22/ decision 57)	The Council took note that given the level of policy and legal diversity in Partner States with respect to social security benefits, it is not possible at this stage, to conclude regulations for the coordination of security benefits	The decision could be reviewed considering that over the years, the policy and legal framework may have changed.
5	(EAC/CM 19/Decision 33).	The Council considered and adopted the revised Post Negotiation Programme on the EAC Common Market.	Implementation is ongoing.

Thoma of

2

-			
6	EAC/CM 19/	The Council also adopted the Model Annex on	The Model Annex was
	Decision 51)	Social Security in order to expedite the	used to develop the
		development of the necessary regulations and	Council directive on
		schedules for the coordination of social security	coordination of social
		benefits in an EAC Common Market in line with	security benefits. The
		agreed upon post negotiations activities of the EAC	Council did not endorse
		Common Market	the directive. (refer EAC
			CM 22/ decision 57)
7	(EAC/SCMEACP	The 27 th Meeting of the Sectoral Council held on 3 rd	Draft progress report
	/27 Decision 01)	November 2017, directed the EAC Secretariat to	was prepared and will be
		prepare a progress report on negotiations on	enriched after the
	*		
		1	
		Meeting of the Council.	•
			,

Observations on the status of implementation of previous decisions and directives

Based on the information provided by Partner States on the directives and decisions regarding social security, the following observations were made:

- (i) Some Partners States have reviewed their national policies and laws on social security to include coordination, portability, and extension of coverage and undertaken some actuarial valuation studies.
- (ii) Some Partner States are reviewing their national policies in line with ILO Convention 102 of 1952.
- (iii) Some Partner States have addressed the issues of adequacy of the benefits offered by social security schemes, financing, management, supervision, regulatory framework, co-ordination and consideration of social security as a constitutional right of the citizens and a responsibility of the State.

The meeting also observed that some policy recommendations/Council directives have remained outstanding in terms of implementation as follows:

- (i) The Forum of Ministers of Labour, directed the Secretariat to work in collaboration with the ILO to develop a schedule on Totalization of Benefits and Administrative Assistance for consideration by the EAC Council.
- (ii) The Council directed the Secretariat to hire a consultant to consolidate the various actuarial studies undertaken by social security organizations, to address among others the financial and economic implications on the coordination of social security study benefits taking into account the current systems, policies and laws in the Partner States (EAC CM/ 22/ directive 68).

Thoma of

 χ^{10}

(iii) The 27th Meeting of the Sectoral Council held on 3rd November 2017, directed the EAC Secretariat to prepare a progress report on negotiations on commitments on social security under the EAC Common Market Protocol and report to the 36th Meeting of the Council. (EAC/SCMEACP/27 Decision 01)

The meeting further observed that there is need to undertake a consultancy study as earlier directed by the Council.

Recommendations.

The meeting recommends to the Forum of Ministers responsible for Labour and Employment to recommend to the Sectoral Council of Ministers responsible for EAC Affairs and Planning to:

- (i) Reiterate Council Directive No EAC CM/ 22/ directive 68, where the EAC Secretariat was directed to contract a consultant to consolidate the various actuarial studies undertaken by social security institutions, to address among others the financial and economic implications on the coordination of social security systems taking into account the current policies and laws in the Partner States.
- (ii) Reiterate the Sectoral Council directive *EAC/SCMEACP/27 Decision 01* where the EAC Secretariat was directed to prepare a progress report on negotiations on commitments on social security under the EAC Common Market Protocol taking into consideration Partner States' status on social security presented in the June 2018, meeting.
- (iii) Partners States to review and/or develop national social security policies and laws on social security to include coordination, portability, and extension of coverage (where applicable).
- (iv) Partner States to review and/or develop national social security policies in line with ILO Convention 102 of 1952; and
- (v) The EAC Secretariat in collaboration with ILO to contract a Consultant to consolidate the Actuarial Studies undertaken by Partner States
- 3.0 PRESENTATION BY PARTNER STATES' OF THEIR STATUS REPORTS ON THE POLICY AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK GOVERNING SOCIAL SECURITY BENEFITS.

The Partner States made the following presentations on the policy and legal frameworks governing social security benefits:

3.1 Republic of Burundi.

 \sim

The country has three (3) public schemes that work in the social security which include: National Social Security Institute (INSS), National Office of Pension and Occupational Risks for de public service and magistrate (ONPR) and Mutual for public service (MFP)

Social security is a public service of the State, which ensures all: the social risks of salaried workers; liberal professions; self-employed and un- employed workers; and agricultural workers

The social security code is being reviewed and with the objective of harmonization of updating it with fundamental social security aspects taking into account of sub region standards.

The Government's initiatives, include: Free medical care for women giving birth, children under 5 years, Health insurance card (CAM) within the Ministry of the public health; and Support of indigents by the Ministry of Human Rights, Social Affairs and Gender

The legal framework includes: Ministerial Order of 2011 setting the required conditions for approval of Mutual Health in Burundi.

The Legislation Governing Persons in the Formal Private Sector includes:

- i. Decree law of 1962 creating the National Institute of Social Security;
- ii. Law of 1980 on Mutual Benefit Society for Public Employees (MFP)
- iii. Decrets1984, on Health Insurance Card/CAM (renewed in 1996 & 2012),

Other Developments include: (i) Decree of 2010, creation of National Office of Pensions and Occupational Risks: ONPR; (ii) Social Protection Policy validated in April 2011; (iii) Decree of 2012, creation of the Executive Secretariat permanent of the National Commission for Social Protection; (iv) Decree of 2013, the National Technical Committee for Social Protection; (v) Decree of 2014, creation of Provincial and Communal Committees for SEP; and (vi) Decree of 2015, creation of social protection funds

3.2 Republic of Kenya

Social Security Trends: The social security covers both Wage Employees and Self-employed and unpaid family workers. The total recorded employment increased from 13.517 million in 2013 to 16.893 million in 2017. There was a marked increase in both the registered employers and employees from 92,100 in 2013 to 134,200 in 2017, and 3.96 M in 2013 to 3.91 M in 2017 respectively. Similarly, both Annual Contributions and Annual Benefits paid increased from 6.5 B in 2013 to 9.4 B in 2017 and 2.8B in 2013 to 4.8 B in 2017 respectively.

Pension Systems: The current pensions and retirement benefits systems in Kenya include the National Social Security Fund – Mandatory Scheme, Non Contributory, that is, Pay As You Go (PAYG)-Civil Service Pension Scheme, Individual Contributory Open

12

) MA

Theran of

Schemes, 70 Years and Above State Old Age Pension Programme, and the Private Occupation Schemes – Employer Related.

Social protection centers on:

- (i) Social security systems statutory employment-related benefits (social insurance, short term cash benefits, social health insurance)
- (ii) Universal social benefit systems benefits for all residents (family allowances, public health services, old age);
- (iii)Social assistance systems poverty alleviation benefits in cash and kind for citizens and residents in special need; and
- (iv) Private benefit systems employment related or individual benefits (occupation pensions, employer provided health insurance)

Policy Framework: The overarching goals of social protection is to ensure that all Kenyans live in dignity and exploit their human capabilities for their own social and economic development. The policy frameworks include the National Social Protection Policy 2015. The policy provides for actions and measures, that enhance the capacity of and opportunities for the poor and vulnerable to improve and sustain lives, livelihoods, and welfare, that enable income-earners and their dependents to maintain a reasonable level of income through decent work, and ensure access to affordable health care, social security and social assistance.

The policy measures under Social Security focus on: -

- i. coordination and integration between schemes,
- ii. modernization of schemes to ensure efficient registration, collection of contributions and benefit payments,
- iii. developing synergies with social security and across the social protection spectrum, by harmonizing benefits where possible and coordinating and integrating a system of providing multi- pillar retirement schemes, supported by integrated coordinated information systems and reliable contributor and beneficiaries' databases;
- iv. increasing adequacy of benefits by setting target replacement rates close to minimum social security standards,
- v. raising contributions to appropriate levels,
- vi. curbing excessive administrative costs, and
- vii. preservation and portability of benefits and ensuring adequate return on investments are passed to contributors and their beneficiaries.

National Employment Policy and Strategy: The policy seeks to promote full employment as a national priority to enable the economically active population attain and secure sustainable livelihood through productive and freely chosen employment. Other policies are Draft Labour Migration Policy, which provides the framework for labour migration and foreign employment administration, and Diaspora Policy that seek to mainstream Diaspora in the social economic development.

X

Labour mobility both within and between the private and public sector is common, however, portability of benefits is limited across schemes due to differing design and funding nature. Labour mobility across borders has increased globally; and Kenyans in the diaspora, including the EAC region, may contribute to the various retirement benefits arrangements in their host countries. But conclusion of their contracts, portability of retirement benefits savings becomes a challenge due to lack of relevant agreements, such as those on double taxation.

The following measures are being taken to address these challenges: -

- i. development of legal and regulatory framework to enhance portability of retirement benefits across schemes.
- ii. collaboration with stakeholders to promote awareness campaigns on members' rights and obligations on various agreements and portability, including examining the possibilities of establishing common regional scheme for workers under a single or related regional group employer, and
- iii. development of appropriate mechanisms and measures to enable collaboration and information sharing among relevant regulators in countries with reciprocal agreements.

In addition, several social assistance initiatives have been put in place to enhance social protection: -

- i. Cash Transfer to Orphans and Vulnerable Children (CT-OVC); Older Persons Cash Transfer (OPCT); Hunger Safety Net Programme (HSNP); Urban Food Subsidy;
- ii. Food and Nutrition to School (School feeding Programme), Food for Assets to vulnerable communities, and HIV and AIDS Nutrition feeding;
- iii. Public Works Programmes, Roads, Tenders to the Youth;
- iv. Grants to People with Severe disabilities and School Bursaries;
- v. Equalization Fund to provide basic services to the marginalized areas to the extent necessary to bring the quality of those areas to the level generally enjoyed by the rest of the nation. The basic services include water, roads, health facilities and electricity.

Ratified ILO Conventions and national legal framework:

The country ratified international labour migration conventions and agreements. These are: (i) the ILO Convention 97 on Migration for Employment and ILO (ii) Convention 143 Migrant Workers; and (iii) the country had initiated the process of ratification of the ILO Convention 102 of 1952 on Social Security. Other signed agreements include Bilateral Labour Agreements (BLAs) with Saudi Arabia, Qatar and United Arab Emirates, and BLAs under negotiation with Jordan, Kuwait, Oman and Lebanon.

The national laws include the Constitution of Kenya, 2010, Employment Act, 2007, Work Injury Benefit Act, 2007, National Social Security Fund Act No 45 of 2013, Public

From

 α^{14}

Service Superannuation Scheme Act, 2012, National Hospital Insurance Fund Act, Retirement Benefits Act Cap 97 Laws of Kenya and Regulations, 2000.

The Retirement Benefits Act Cap 97 Laws of Kenya and Regulations, 2000 resulted in the establishment of the Retirement Benefits Authority (RBA). The RBA regulates supervises and promotes retirement benefits schemes; promotes development of the retirement benefits sector and advises the Government on national policy to be followed on retirement benefits matters. Currently, about 1300 schemes have been registered and are managed by the Regulator.

3.3. Republic of Rwanda

The country has a National Social Security Policy adopted in February 2009 and national social protection strategy 2011. The policy provides for: mandatory coverage, types and Adequacy of benefits, management and supervision. The Strategy provides for a social protection floor and participation of the informal sector in the contributory social security system.

Health Sector Policy. January 2015; universal accessibility (in geographical and financial terms) of equitable and affordable quality health services (preventative, curative, rehabilitative and promotional services) for all Rwandans. Programs, Systems support and Governance.

Health Financing Sustainability Policy. March 2015

The National Community Health Policy was adopted in June 2015. The policy aimed at; Strengthening Decentralized health structures; Strengthening; Participation of Community members; Monitoring and evaluation of systems and coordination of Community health services; and Strengthening the motivation of CHW's

Legal Framework: The legal framework includes; RSSB Law no 45/2010 of 14/12/2010 and CBHI Law no 03/2015 of 02/03/2015.

The following comprise Pension & Occupational Hazards schemes;

- Defined benefits. 8% Employees Salary. 5% Employer & 3% Employee
- Decree- Law 1974 & implementing orders
- Law no 06/2003 of 22/03/2003 modifying and completing the Decree-Law.
- Law no 05/2015 of 30/03/2015 governing the organization of Pension Scheme
- Presidential Order no 06/01 of 13/04/2018 increase of Pension and OH benefits

Under the Maternity Leave scheme: Mandatory. 0,6% of gross salary equally shared and Law N°03/2016 of 30/03/2016 & implementing order.

Medical scheme for the Formal sector: This includes Health coverage for Formal sector. Mandatory for Publics servants, Voluntary for Private sector & retirees. 15% of Employee basic's salary equally shared. Law no 24/2001 of 27/04/2001.

Fran 9

M

Mutuelle de Santé for the Informal sector: this covers Health coverage for Informal sector. Voluntary with contribution based on social economic category: Law no 03/2015 of 02/03/2015; Long Term Savings schemes are: Law no 29/2017 of 29/06/2017 Prime's Minister of 58/03 of 04/04/2018.

There are existing bilateral agreements with Burundi and Congo-DRC

3.4 The United Republic of Tanzania:

The country has established a National Social Security Policy 2003, which is currently under review and Zanzibar Social Protection Policy, 2014. Social security is a constitutional right entrenched in Article 11 and considers Social Protection as constitutional right and responsibility of state.

In terms of coverage, the government developed and implanted Social Security Extension Strategy. This has resulted in conversion of Government Employees Pensions Fund (GEPF) from Provident Fund to Pension Fund in 2013. The Government established Workers Compensation Fund (WCF) in 2015. Further, the URT has increased minimum pension from (Tzs 20,000 – 50,000) per month to Tzs 100,000 per month in 2016. Similarly, Tanzania Zanzibar has increased pension from Tzs 40,000 to Tzs 90,000 and indexed pension to 30 percent of minimum Wage.

There are arrangements to extend coverage to the informal sector to access Social Security services through Deposit Administration Scheme (DAS at PPF); Deposit Administration Scheme DAS at Local Authority Pensions Fund (LAPF); Voluntary Savings Retirement Scheme VSRS) at the Government Employee Pensions Fund (GEPF); Pension Saving Scheme PSS at the Public Service Pension Fund (PSPF). The informal schemes at NSSF are Wakulima (Farmers) scheme, Wavuvi (Fishers) and Madini (Minerals) Scheme. All schemes accept contributions through mobile some voluntary schemes accept contributions at the collection centres in the form of commodities.

Benefits have improved with introduction of Unemployment Benefits and mortgage in the mainland and Universal Pension in Tanzania Zanzibar 20,000Tsh per month for every 70 years and above elder person. In Tanzania Mainland there is a Tanzania Social Actions Fund (TASAF) programme for cash transfers to poor households. Also the government has established Community Health Funds (CHFs) for 169.

The legal and Regulatory Framework include:

The National Social Security Fund NSSF Act Cap. 50;

The Public Service Pension Fund PSPF Act Cap; 371

Rown f

x 16

- The PPF Pensions Fund PPF Act Cap; 372
- The LAPF Pensions Fund LAPF Act Cap; 407
- The GEPF Benefits Retirement Fund GEPF Act Cap 51
- The Workers Compensation Fund WCF Act Cap; 263
- The National Health Insurance NHIF Act Cap; 395
- PSSSF Act No.2 of 2018;

The United Republic of Tanzania established the Regulatory Body in the year 2010 through Social Security Regulatory Act Cap. 135. The authority manages to supervise the entire Social Security Sector.

The United Republic of Tanzania has ratified the following ILO Conventions.

- i. C29 Forced Labour Convention;
- ii. C87 Freedom of Association;
- iii. C98 Rights to Organize and Collective Bargaining Convention;
- iv. C100 Equal Pay Convention;
- v. C111 Prohibition of Discrimination in Employment and Occupation Convention:
- vi. C105 Prohibition of Forced Labour Convention;
- vii. C138 Minimum age convention; and
- viii. C182 Worst Forms of Child.

ILO Social Protection Conventions Ratified by Tanzania

- 1. C 152 Occupational Safety and Health (Document Work) of 1979
- 2. C 17 Workmen's Compensation (Accidents) convention, of 1925;
- 3. C 144 Tripartite Consultation (International Labour Standards) convention, of 1976;
- 4. C 182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, of 1921;
- 5. C 12 Workmen's Compensation (Agriculture) convention of 1921; and
- 6. C 19 Equality of Treatment (Accidents Compensation) convention of 1925

3.5 Republic of South Sudan:

Background on National Social Insurance Fund

The idea of NSIF came up because of pressure of necessity and duty as felt by the state toward the social and economic status of workers in a fixed income group. For that reason, an Institution was established to be called "Institute of Social Insurance for the Employees working in the then republic of Sudan. It was an independent Institution under the supervision of a Minister having a separate budget and responsible for the management of the Social Insurance. The Headquarter was situated in Khartoum the capital city of the Republic of Sudan with branch offices in the other states of the

Thoron of

17

Ki

M

Country. The Institute have Board of Directors- appointed by the President, which composed of the Chairman and ten Members.

Legal framework for social security: This includes the National Social Security Insurance Fund (NSIF) 2017 establishes a social insurance fund for the private sector and exempts the following categories of public officers;

- · Constitutional executive and legislative post holders.
- Members of the National Legislature and State Legislative Assembly.
- All Justices and Judges of the Judiciary of South Sudan.
- Members of the Armed Forces.
- Members of the law enforcement Agencies i.e. the Polices, Prisons, Fire Brigades, Wildlife, Customs, and Security Service.
- · All the Government Employees in the Republic of South Sudan.
- UN International Staff

There are schemes for social security, namely: the Pension scheme regulated by South Sudan Pension Act 2012 and South Sudan Civil service Act 2013; SSIF Scheme regulated by Social Insurance Act 1990 amended 2004; and South Sudan social Insurance Bill development stage awaiting submission to the Council of Ministers.

Policy Framework

South Sudan has not yet developed polices relevant to Social security. However, a study has been conducted the outcome of which will inform the process of develop a policy governing social security.

3.5 Republic of Uganda

In Uganda the Social Protection system is comprised of two pillars; Social security and Social care and support services. The National Social Protection Policy 2015 defines Social Protection as Public and Private Interventions to address risks and vulnerabilities that expose individuals to income security and social deprivation leading to undignified lives. It is a basic service and human right that ensures dignity of people.

Social security covers direct income support and social insurance. Formal social security providers are Public Service Pension's scheme, NSSF and Parliamentary Pension Scheme. The purpose of this is to ensure that workers are guaranteed a decent life upon retirement. Social insurance component also includes health insurance. Direct Income Support includes non –contributory cash transfers and Labour Intensive Public Works.

Legal Frame work

The Constitution of the Republic of Uganda under the National Objectives and Directive Principles of State Policy provide for Social Protection and Security in the following ways:

Aforan J

 \propto

- a) Objective Vii: States that "the State shall make reasonable provision for the welfare and maintenance of the aged" to which we have established a Social Action Grant where a monthly grant is given to the elderly.
- b) Objective XI: The State shall give the highest priority to the enactment of legislation, establishing measures that protect and enhance the right of the people to equal opportunities in development; In this regard, the Government has enacted the equal opportunities Commission Act No. 2 of 2007 which established the Equal Opportunities Commission.
- c) Objective XVI(b): All Ugandans should enjoy rights and opportunities and access to education, Health Service, clean and safe water, work, shelter, clothing, pension and retirement benefits. **Other Laws include:**
- 1. The Pensions Act Chapter 286: It regulates pensions in respect to public service pension scheme where the benefits are paid upon one reaching retirement and amounts paid in monthly instalments.
- 2. NSSF Act enacted in 1985 which establishes the NSSF which receives contributions from employers, 10% is paid by the employer and the 5% is deducted from the employees' wages. S. 51 of the NSSF Act provides for reciprocal agreements in which reciprocal arrangements are made with the government of any country in which a fund or scheme similar to the Fund has been established. The Act is under review and proposals have been made to address identified gaps in existing law to allow access to social security.
- 3. Uganda Retirement Benefits Regulatory Authority Act 2011 regulates all pension schemes in both private and public sector.

The Uganda Vision 2040 and National Development Plan underscore the importance of social protection which is meant to address risks and vulnerabilities. Government recognizes the need to provide assistance to people who are vulnerable either by age, social class, location, disability, gender or disaster or those who do not earn any income.

Observations:

Following the Partner States presentations, the meeting made the following observations:

- (i) The policy and legal frameworks of the Partner States had not adequately covered aspects of co-ordination of social security systems within the EAC Partner States.
- (ii) The coordination of social security systems prevents loss of accrued benefits rights as the worker moves from one scheme to another within and among other Partner States for employment.

From

 A^{19}

- (iii) The processes of coordinating social security systems in the EAC Partner States can be affected by the different fiscal policies such as taxation, inflation and exchange rates.
- Benchmarking with other RECs would enhance the process in the EAC (iv) region
- The need to build capacities of the lesser developed schemes within the (v) Partner States

The presentation by Partner States are attached hereto as Annex III (a-f)

Recommendations:

The meeting recommends to the Forum of Ministers responsible for Labour and Employment to recommend to the Sectoral Council of Ministers responsible for EAC Affairs and Planning to:

- (i) direct Partner States to implement the Council Directive to amend their respective national laws to conform to the EAC Common Market Protocol (Ref EAC/CM/34 Directive 26)
- (ii) direct Partner States to include provisions on co-ordination and/or portability of social security benefits during the review and development of national policies and laws to facilitate the free movement of workers with their social security benefits in the EAC region as provided for under the EAC Common Market Protocol.
- (iii) urge Partner States to share and learn from the good practices within the Community and other RECs in the review and development of social security policies and laws; and
- (iv) direct EAC Secretariat in collaboration with ILO to undertake a comprehensive assessment of social security in the Republic of South Sudan and support the Republic of Burundi in the area of co-ordination of social security systems.

4.0 ILO PRESENTATION ON COORDINATION OF SOCIAL SECURITY SYSTEMS

The ILO made a presentation on the coordination of social security systems. The presentation highlighted that the rules on social security coordination do not replace national systems. All Partner States are free to decide who is to be insured under their legislation, which benefits are granted and under what conditions. The presentation pointed out that coordination of social security rules provides common rules to protect social security rights of migrant workers when moving within (EAC) Partner States. Thus, coordination rules prevents workers from losing insurance periods and acquired

20

rights because of their migration status and enables a worker to earn a pension that is proportionate to the insured record of service. The rules do not only benefit of the migrant worker, but also in the Partner States, including provision of equal distribution of the pension charges.

The principles of coordination of social security laid down in ILO Conventions 102; 118 and 157 were also highlighted. The principles include the equality of treatment between nationals and non-national, the maintenance of rights in course of acquisition, maintence of acquired rights and provision of benefits abroad, the determination of applicable legislation as well as the mutual administrative assistance. The principles have been articulated in various EAC policy frameworks on portability of benefits within the EAC Common Market. For instance, the Burundi and Nairobi Draft directives of 2011and 2012 respectively articulated these principles to ensure adequate portability of social security benefits. The ILO also presented on the implications of coordination rules on calculations using different scenarios.

Observations:

The meeting observed that the processes of reviewing the existing policy and legal frameworks should take into consideration the International labour standards and good practices in EAC Partner States, other RECs and economic grouping outside the continent including the EU social security coordination framework.

Recommendations:

The meeting recommends to the Forum of Ministers responsible for Labour and Employment to recommend to the Sectoral Council of Ministers responsible for EAC Affairs and Planning to:

- (i) direct the EAC Secretariat to request the ILO to provide technical support to Partner States to undertake assessment of their national policy and legal frameworks in line with International Labour Standards on social security and labour migration issues; and
- (ii) direct Partner States to ratify and domesticate the relevant conventions protecting the rights of migrant workers including Conventions No.102 on social security, C118 on equality of treatment and C157 on maintenance of social security rights for migrant workers.

The ILO presentation on coordination of social Security Systems, is attached hereto as Annex IV

5.0 PRESENTATION OF PARTNER STATES STATUS REPORTS ON THE FINDINGS OF THE ACTUARIAL STUDIES CONDUCTED BY THEIR NATIONAL SOCIAL SECURITY INSTITUTIONS.

The Partner States made presentations on the findings of the actuarial studies conducted by the national social security institutions as follows:

5.1 Republic of Burundi.

The Republic of Burundi has not conducted actuarial studies and is process of mobilising resources and technical support from ILO to undertake the studies.

5.2 Republic of Kenya.

Asset Categories. The overall industry investment portfolio by June 2017 was KĘS 963.05 billion (US\$9.4 billion). The percentages per category were: - Government Securities - 353.47 Billion 36.70%; Quoted Equities 180.35 Billion 18.73%; Immovable Property 204.60 Billion 21.25%; Guaranteed Funds 103.67 Billion 10.76%; Listed Corporate Bonds 46.83 Billion 4.86%; Fixed Deposits 45.49 Billion 4.72%; Offshore - 9.68 Billion 1.00%; Cash - 13.91 Billion 1.44%; Unquoted Equities 3.91 Billion 0.41%; Private Equity 0.25 Billion 0.03; REITS 0.888 Billion 0.09% Commercial paper, non-listed bonds by private companies 0.002 Billion 0%

Legal Basis: The Actuarial Valuation for the National Social Security Fund (NSSF) is carried out based on the following legal provisions: -

- i. Section 31 (1) (a) RBA Act A Defined Benefit scheme shall at least once in every three (3) years from the date of registration be valued by an actuary in a prescribed form and submit a report to the regulator and sponsor.
- ii. Section 31(1)(b) The Regulator may require defined contribution schemes to be reviewed from time to time.
- iii. Section 52 of NSSF Act requires that actuarial valuation be undertaken at least once in every three (3) years.

NSSF undertakes actuarial valuation review annually.

Scope of Actuarial Studies

The scope includes assessment of financial soundness of the scheme and ability to satisfactorily discharge obligations to its members. This entails: -

- i. Assessment of accrued liabilities to the members.
- ii. Assessment of Assets.
- iii. Comparison of assets and liabilities to determine financial position.
- iv. Assessment of cash flow and liquidity position.
- v. Review of historic and current experience.
- vi. Trades in investment, expenses and benefits.
- vii. Advise on interest that may be credited to members.

G

M

Thoron of

Results

The key results showed the benefits and adequacy of benefits as follows: -

- i. Membership data estimates was 5 million as at June 2017;
- ii. Assets estimates was KES.196.88 billion (US\$ 1.93 billion) as at June 2017;
- iii. Analysis of emerging experience revealed a Contributions Progression of 2012/2013 KES. 7b to 2016/2017 KES.14b; and Benefits Progression of 2011/12 KES 1.75b, 2016/17 KES. 3.5b;
- iv. Interest declaration averaged 6%:
- v. The Fund's Interest Declaration policy provides a minimum of 2.5 % interest to be paid as per the actuarial review results; and
- vi. The Fund is liquid and able to meet its obligations (liabilities) 100%.

5.3 United Republic of Tanzania

Between the year 2011 and 2018, the Social Protection Schemes in the United of Republic of Tanzania have been implementing actuarial studies after every three years in line with the guideline provided by the Social Security Regulatory Authority. Among other factors, the insights from the actuarial valuations have induced the country to embark on parametric reform of the sector. Over the same period of time, the Social Security Regulatory Authority has issued various Guidelines with respect to the totalization of the contribution periods, investments practices, harmonization of benefits and administrative expenses. Also, partly the findings of actuarial studies have prompted the United of Republic of Tanzania to merge and restructure the Social Security Funds from five Funds to two Funds in the year 2018. Under this new set up, the Public Service Social Security Fund (PSSF) caters for public sector employees, while the National Social Security Sector cover the informal sector.

The presentation highlighted that there on going actuarial studies covering Pension Fund, Workers Compensation Fund and Health Insurance Funds that are expected to be finalized during the year 2018. Beyond demonstrating that the Social Protection Schemes contain adequate liquidity and robust long term financial sustainability, the presentation made by the United Republic of Tanzania entailed suggestions on the way forward for East African Community (EAC) regarding the planned mission of consolidating actuarial analysis in the region. More notable, the United of Republic of Tanzania have recommended that the assignment should start by ensuring that the actuarial studies of the EAC member states fulfil the International Standards for Social Security Funds. Furthermore, the portability assignment should first focus on Mandatory Contributory Pension Schemes and then followed by Mandatory Health Insurance and Workers Compensations Schemes

 \propto^{23}

5.4 Republic of Uganda

The National Social Security Fund of Uganda undertook an actuarial valuation services for the fund in 2012. The objective of the study was to undertake an actuarial valuation and suggest alternative options that the fund may consider in anticipation of the liberalization of the Retirement Sector in Uganda.

The findings of the study were as follows;

- i) Solvency of the NSSF: The liabilities of the NSSF were directly linked to the assets on the balance sheet. The Fund was satisfied the accounts and balance sheet as at 30th June 2018 showed that NSSF was capable of meeting its obligation to pay the amounts credited to the individual accounts of its members
- ii) Current membership profile: The fund had over 500,000 active members eligible to pay contributions. The members constituted 39% of membership and own 94% of the total member fund balance. The other 61% of membership were not active; do not make contributions and owned 6% of the member fund balance as at 30th June 2012. 85% were below the age of 45 years and owned 70% of the active members' fund and: 70% of inactive members are above the age of 54 and own 36% of the inactive members' fund balance
- iii) Historical real Returns to members: The fund has historically been crediting members with less than the rate of inflation. This was because historical returns have been low while expense base relatively high
- iv) No interest is declared on contributions paid into the fund during the year. It was estimated that the impact of not crediting of members with interest in respect of contributions paid into the fund during any one year as at June 30th 2012 was 2.9% for a member that started contributing in 1992 based on comparing fund balance as provided for by the NSSF Act
- v) Low compliance rate for paying contributions into the fund; the analysis of the expected contribution period as at June 30th 2012 implied by the fund balance and salary data indicates that members have on average contributed for fewer years that expected. Members have on average, have histrorically not complied with the requirements of the NSSF Act to pay contributions. As at 30th June 2012 only 2.7 of the population aged 16 to 54 years were saving with the NSSF
- vi) Members benefit expectations: The combined effect of crediting negative real interest to member's account not crediting interest on on contributions paid

into the fund during any one year and low compliance rate points towards poor adequacy of benefits as at June 2012

vii) Projected growth of the fund: Assuming it is not significantly affected by liberalization, the fund is projected to grow significantly as a result of combination of growth in working age population, a projected increase in the proportion of the population saving with the NSSF, improvements in the compliance rate and projected increasing in earnings. It was projected that the fund would have 1 million active members by 2022 and 2 million active members by 2030. An average of 75,000 new members was projected over the next 5 years. Total assets were projected to double in size reaching UGX 5.8 Trillion by 2020. No deficits were projected. With liberalization however total assets were projected to reduce before returning to current levels of about 3 Million Trillion in 2020. Deficits projected from 2016 mainly as a result of withdrawal be

viii)nefits; among others.

Recommendations:

- a) Suggested option for liberalization: apply to the Uganda Retirement Benefits Authority (UBRA) to become a scheme with in - house administrative function as provided for under the Act
- b) Asset Allocation: the fund was projected to generate positive cash flows in future so consideration should be made towards gradually increasing holdings of equity in order to achieve optimal balance
- c) Expenses; consider strategies to reduce expenses at base
- d) Membership data needed to be cleaned in order to establish a reasonable basis upon which future valuations and operations in the liberalised scheme environment can be undertaken; among others

Full findings and recommendations of the study is here to attached.

5.6 Republic of South Sudan.

The actuarial studies were conducted by the Government of Sudan. However, with the Republic of South Sudan, upon attaining independence, has prioritized conducting actuarial studies as one of the initiatives under social security sectors. The Government is mobilising resources and will need technical support from ILO to undertake the studies.

Observations

The meeting observed that:

- i. actuarial valuations when carried out at a Regional Level using common/standardized parameters/methodologies can lead to comparable results with respect to contribution rates; products (benefits); Investment Policy; Schemes; operating environment.
- ii. Common guidelines are necessary to achieve and enhance comparability and integration in the approach used in actuarial valuation in the EAC Partner States.
- iii. The Republic of Burundi and the Republic of South Sudan have not undertaken any actuarial valuations since 2011
- iv. The other Partner States have undertaken actuarial valuations between 2012 and January 2018, focusing on specific national interests and needs and did not take into account the regional mobility of workers and coordination/portability issues.

Recommendations:

The meeting recommends to the Forum of Ministers responsible for Labour and Employment to recommend to the Sectoral Council of Ministers responsible for EAC Affairs and Planning to:

- (i) direct the Republic of South Sudan and Republic of Burundi to undertake actuarial studies to determine the sustainability of their social security schemes and assess the financial, fiscal and economic implications on the coordination/portability of benefits to other Partner States; and
- (ii) direct the Republic of Uganda, Republic of Kenya, Republic of Rwanda and the United Republic of Tanzania to update their most recent actuarial valuations and address financial, fiscal and economic implications of coordination/portability of social security benefits within the region

6.0 CONSIDERATION OF TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE STUDY ON CONSOLIDATION OF THE ACTUARIAL STUDIES UNDERTAKEN BY PARTNER STATES' SOCIAL SECURITY INSTITUTIONS

The meeting developed Terms of Reference (ToR's) for the consolidation of the actuarial studies to facilitate the coordination of social security systems within an EAC Common Market Framework. The ToR includes the background information on previous

Thron Y

26 X J. G.

Council Decisions and Directives regarding social security. It provides general and specific objectives, rationale, scope, output and deliverables as well as the required competencies for the consultant.

The draft Terms of Reference are attached hereto as Annex V

7.0 DEVELOPMENT OF THE ROADMAP FOR THE REVISION AND FINALISATION OF THE DRAFT COUNCIL DIRECTIVE ON THE COORDINATION OF SOCIAL SECURITY BENEFITS WITHIN AN EAC COMMON MARKET

SN	Activity / Event	Target date	Responsibility center.
1	Review of the draft Directive/ Validation by Social Security experts	August 2018	EAC Secretariat, Social security experts, Social Partners, ILO experts and a Consultant
2	Support to South Sudan to undertake the assessment of social security	October 2018	EAC Secretariat and ILO
3	Undertaking the consolidated Actuarial studies	February 2019	EAC Secretariat and ILO
4	Draft Directive presented to the Forum of the Ministers of Labour	March 2019	EAC Secretariat and Partner States
5	Consideration of the draft Directive by the Sectoral Council of Ministers responsible for EAC Affairs and Planning	June 2019	EAC Secretariat and Partner States
6	Presentation of the draft Directive to the Council of Ministers for consideration	August 2019	EAC Secretariat.

8.0 ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The meeting noted that in order to fast track the consolidation of the actuarial evaluation, the Secretariat should prepare a template that summarizes actuarial parameters as at 30th December 2017 which includes but not limited to:

- i. Demographic Data mortality, fertility, and population;
- ii. Labour Market like labour force, employed and immigration;
- iii. Micro economic data GDP, inflation, exchange rate, interest rate, wage and productivity:
- iv. Data on reserves investments, assets, income and expenditure;
- v. Contribution rate;
- vi. Vesting period;
- vii. Benefits offered and qualifying criteria:
- viii. Replacement rate; and
- ix. Pension formula.

This could be followed by the working sessions attended by statisticians and actuarial experts from the Partner States to consolidate the required inputs.

There being no other business the meeting adjourned at 17h00.

SIGNED on this 13th day of June 2018 by the Heads of Delegation of

EAC Partner States hereunder:

Florence Alarango Ruranganwa

Diane

Florence 4

Nyamb

Kenneth

Loboka Wani Wilson Dr. Irene Charles

Isaka

Principal Gender

Offiicer

Head of Department Actuary ONPR

Director

Manager of

operation SSPF& NSIF **Director General**

SSRA

Ministry of EAC

Rwanda Social

Security Board

Ministry of

Ministry of EAC

South Sudan

Office

Affairs

Human Rights,

Social Affairs and Gender

and Northern Corridor

Pension Fund

Prime Minister's

Republic of Uganda

Republic of Rwanda

Republic of Republic of Burundi

Kenya

Republic of South

United Republic of Tanzania

Sudan

28