



REPORT
ON
Skills Training Workshop on Diagnostic Tools for the Extension of Social Protection
and Promotion of Employment
Phnom Penh Hotel, Phnom Penh, Cambodia
November 2-4, 2011

I. Introduction

A Skills Training Workshop on Diagnostic Tools for the Extension of Social Protection and Promotion of Employment was conducted from November 2-4, 2011 at the Phnom Penh Hotel, in Phnom Penh City, Kingdom of Cambodia.

Thirty-five participants from government institutions, employers associations, CAMFEB, and trade unions in the Kingdom of Cambodia were invited and attended the workshop.

The Skills Training Workshop was conducted by the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training with technical and financial assistance from the ILO/EU Project “Improving Social Protection and Promoting Employment” to share experiences and lessons learnt regarding the development of social protection and national employment policies between the Royal Government of Cambodia and the ILO.

The objectives of the Skills Training Workshop were: (i) to provide the member organizations of the project Tripartite Consultative Group/ Steering Committee with relevant planning tools for the formulation of national strategies; (ii) to transfer knowledge and to build capacity regarding diagnostic tools for social protection and employment promotion; and (iii) to share knowledge and information on the design and the implementation of social protection and employment promotion policies in Cambodia and abroad.

DAY 1

II. Opening Ceremony:

At the opening ceremony, Mr. Ouk Ravuth, the project focal point at the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT), introduced the honorable guests to the workshop participants. Mr. Chuop Narath, Deputy Director of the Employment and Manpower Department of MoLVT, provided warm welcome remarks to His Excellency Mr. Chap Rithy, representative of His Excellency Mr. Vong Sauth, Minister for Labour and Vocational Training. He thanked Mr. Helmut Schwarzer, Chief Technical Advisor of ILO EU Project and all the participants for attending the training, sharing their experiences, for contributing to the development of an implementation strategy for social protection, and to the development of a National Employment Policy under the financial assistance of the EU and with the technical assistance of the ILO.

Mr. Helmut Schwarzer, CTA of the ILO-EU Project made brief remarks on the country-level projects in Cambodia, Honduras and Burkina Faso. The overall goal of the project is to help fight the poverty, to develop a social protection system and a national employment policy. These thematic issues are not only a part of decent work, but part of ensuring decent life for all. Therefore, the goal of the project is extremely important for people worldwide. He added that social protection and employment policies are two among the most powerful tools contributing to fighting poverty in each country. Thus it is necessary to prepare and establish these policies in a way that they can have a wholly positive effect by improving people's lives through addressing these three goals at the same time.

After thanking all international and national guests as well as the participants, His Excellency Mr. Chap Rithy, Under-Secretary of State of MoLVT, officially opened the workshop by making his remarks as follows:

- The Ministry was pleased to cooperate with the ILO with financial assistance from European Union on the establishment of the National Employment Policy and National Social Protection Strategy, both of which are very important in contributing to the improvement of Cambodian living conditions.
- He reminded the workshop of the previous tripartite discussion on March 14th, 2011 establishing a Tripartite Consultative Group (TCG) for the ILO/EU Project "Improving Social Protection and Promoting Employment" in Cambodia. The group comprised members from different government institutions, representatives of the employer associations and of trade unions in Cambodia.
- He explained the roles of the TCG as guiding the work plan of the project, providing input regarding the results of studies before their submission to the government, aiding in finding methodology to coordinate with different agencies and monitoring all activities of the project.
- After thanking all guests and participants once again, His Excellency Mr. Chap Rithy declared the official opening of the Skills Training Workshop.

III. Technical Sessions:

The training was divided into ten technical sessions, sharing sessions with relevant institutions and two group discussions. Most of the sessions used Power Point presentations with translations into the Cambodian language (Khmer) and simultaneous translation. After each presentation, the participants were provided a reasonable time for questions and answers. The following are the briefings of each session and results of the group work.

Technical session 1: Tools and Methodologies:

Mr. Helmut Schwarzer, CTA of the ILO-EU project and Senior Specialist from the ILO Headquarters, presented the tools and methods for designing and implementing employment promotion and social protection policies. His presentation focused on the following:

Five important tools in the field of employment:

- National employment policy guideline and the step by step approach for the development of a policy.
- Employment diagnostic tool, a tool which helps participants to prioritize the actions, to structurally analyze the employment situation, and to generate recommendations.
- Targeting tool for the quantification of a productive employment target.

- Employment assessment tool for the prioritization of the sectors targeted by employment policies.
- Convention 122 from 1964 concerning employment policy. The objectives and contents of the Convention were briefly explained to the workshop.

Mr. Schwarzer also presented the five important tools in the field of social protection:

- The study “Social Protection Expenditure and Performance Review” (SPER) and a description of the methodology. The goal of the study is to collect information and recommendations for the development of social policies.
 - Actuarial projections, calculations, scenarios will be needed to forecast the beneficiaries, contributors, expenditures, revenues, reserves, and the period of time for which the reserve can cover the expenditure. Additionally, when conditions change, partners should reevaluate to ensure their continued balance.
- 1- A social budget is built upon the Social Protection Expenditure and Performance Review (SPER). Policy makers shall have an overview of social policies that could calculate the global social protection expenditure and revenue of the country. . Building social budget is try to identify what will be the financial need to cover the expenditure.
- Rapid Assessment Protocol (RAP): The goal of the RAP is to evaluate the cost of various policies. It is used to ascertain the cost of the extension of different programmes, with a focus on the social protection floor. In the case of Cambodia, the data available is not sufficient to perform a fully-fledged Social Budget process, but allows for a RAP calculation.
 - Convention 102: A convention establishing the minimum standards for social security. If a member state intends to ratify Convention 102, a comparative analysis of legislation and practice in accordance with C.102 will be carried out; thus illustrating the steps required in order to fulfill the requirements of the minimum standards.

Technical Session 2: Employment in Asia and in Cambodia:

Ms. Sukti Dasgupta, Senior Employment Specialist with the ILO Decent Work Team in Bangkok, gave a presentation titled “Employment in Asia and in Cambodia”. She focused on growth in most countries in Asia including China and India, noting however, that many countries still face labour shortage problems, requiring more migrant workers while other countries have labour surpluses and are therefore the origin countries of migrant workers. During the recent global economic crisis, people throughout Asia were affected and Asian exports also declined, with resulting negative effects on employment in both quantity and quality, creating vulnerable employment. Despite the crisis, many countries were able to introduce stimulus packages and therefore lessen the impact of the crisis. The experience of Asia during the crisis underscored the export promotion based nature of growth in the region.. Since the crisis affected the region’s economies as a whole, the crisis has led to discussions about ways in which to achieve a balance between domestic and export-based economic growth. Despite a severe decline in GDP growth, most Asian countries have recovered from the crisis. The strong recovery in GDP has been accompanied by a recovery in employment figures, though these gains are primarily the results of the growth in vulnerable employment. Thus while the quantity of jobs has increased, the employment is lacking in quality. The prominence of vulnerable employment during the recovery period demonstrates why social protection needs to be introduced.

Employment in Asia has not yet reached pre-crisis levels due to growth dynamics in the region, primarily its dependence on the export of garments, toys and other manufactured goods. The labour market in Asia faces several large challenges, namely the late recovery of wages, limited productivity growth and a falling unemployment rate yet rising vulnerability, demonstrated by the fact that 70% of the world's working poor are living in Asia. Worldwide, studies have shown that 1.2 billion workers are in vulnerable employment. Illustrating the trend mentioned above, statistics have shown that the GDP growth rate is higher than the employment growth rate. China serves as a useful example, with a GDP growth rate of 10.5% but an employment growth rate of only 0.9% between 2001 and 2008. The study also showed that there was large disparity between labour supply and demand, and that there is a need for strong political will to promote full and productive employment effectively and sustainably in order to reduce poverty and vulnerability. In order to address the situation, the Chinese government created the Active Employment Policy (AEP) and then after several years moved from the AEP to the Employment Promotion Law (EPL) which enriched the framework of the AEP and improved the target range and policy content. India serves as another example, using its National Employment Policy to focus on accelerating the growth of formal employment and improving the quality and productivity of jobs in the informal sector.

Ms. Dasgupta also discussed the employment situation in Cambodia by reviewing the background information and the fast growth in employment in the country since the mid-1990s. This growth has contributed to the reduction of poverty and there has also been a remarkable trend of a decline in the gender gap in the labour force. At its highest, employment growth reached 3.6%, with a low unemployment rate of 1.6%, owing to the fact that the unemployed cannot afford to remain so and will work regardless of the type of job..

The economic crisis has shown that social protection is a key tool in improving standards of living. The garment industry, Cambodia's leading export sector, has been affected by the crisis with more broadly implications for employment growth. Ms. Dasgupta suggested that the training workshop would also discuss ways in which Cambodia can ensure employment growth and combat poverty, particularly in rural areas. Due to the crisis, the structure of Cambodian employment has changed and is now mainly driven by the agricultural sector, which has primarily absorbed the surplus labor force.

Additionally, the working age population has expanded rapidly. The Cambodian government will seek to provide its expanding labour force with decent jobs, in sufficient quantity as well as quality. On a positive note, Cambodia's current population is more literate than a decade ago in addition to being young, dynamic and with lower dependency than is the case in neighboring countries such as China and Thailand.

Post-crisis, rebalancing Cambodia's economy between the export sector and the country's domestic market has become a core issue. Thus for Cambodia, which still lags behind other South East Asian countries in terms of productivity, the linkage between social protection and employment promotion is central to the country's recovery. In addition to a shortage of labour market information systems and weak social dialogue, around 82% of Cambodia's workforce is in rural areas and thus working in the relatively vulnerable agricultural sector.

GDP and employment growth should occur in tandem in order to increase productivity and encourage better organization of the labour market. The disparity between the GDP and employment growth rates has led to inequality, illustrating the crucial role of social protection

strategies in redistributing economic gains. Development frameworks will need to be employment oriented, creating decent and sufficient employment for the population. It is insufficient to create a system based on a lower number of people working in a productive capacity with the remainder of the population reliant on social protection mechanisms, underscoring the importance of development frameworks based on employment will push the population into the labour market.

Technical Session 3: Key ILO Conventions and recommendations to serve as benchmark and provide guidance in the design of employment policies

Ms. Claire Harasty, Senior Employment Specialist from the Employment Policy Department of ILO Headquarters discussed the global context of the lack of job opportunities, the quality of jobs and the unstable economy.

The global context is creating a new momentum for employment policy by making employment a central priority for the G20. For the ILO, an employment policy should serve as a coherent vision and framework linking policy interventions (quality and quantity of employment) and stakeholders (Ministry of Labour and other ministries concerned) with influence regarding employment promotion.

The Convention 122 sets out three guiding principles, namely quantity, quality (the work has to provide income at least above the poverty line), and non-discrimination (freedom of choice, and the possibility for each worker to use his or her skills irrespective of race, colour, sex, religion, political opinion, national extraction or social origin).

The policy framework is the Global Employment Agenda 2006, with six key policy areas including employment expansion, skills and human resources development, enterprise development, labour market institutions and policies (including jobs placement and social dialogue), governance, representation and advocacy (social dialogue, social agreements) and social protection. Gender equality and informality are to be mainstreamed. After the global economic crisis, a discussion at the International Labour Conference led to a resolution on unemployment, which provides guidance on two levels: job placement and providing advocacy.

While governments are currently concerned with increasing employment, increasing productivity will require additional government intervention. Furthermore, productivity increases will exclude some sectors of the labour force. One option for governments is to pursue intervention along the lines of social protection. An example of this is the National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (NREGA)¹ scheme in India, which provides jobs to those who are in the labour market but who are not able to access productive jobs. Governments must address the needs of sectors such as this as part of their employment policy.

Ms. Harasty added that the way to make various ministries work together is to establish coordination through a national framework. In addition, social dialogue could engage workers and employers, both of whom are social partners with significant knowledge and important input on national objectives.

¹ NREGA: A scheme in India to enhance livelihood security in rural areas by providing up to 100 days of guaranteed employment each fiscal year to every household whose adult members volunteer for unskilled manual work in public projects.

Some recommendations on policy approaches were discussed, including:

- Macroeconomic policies: fiscal policy should have employment as an objective and public investment should aim at creating employment.
- Employment targeting: setting a clear employment objective. Setting a target or employment objective can ensure that ministries and institutions will work together towards a common goal.
- Social protection: creating social protection schemes is also a way to create more employment or to increase employability. Example: the Bolsa Família Scheme or NREGA.
- Non discrimination: a means of ensuring that individuals are not excluded, particularly people with disabilities and other vulnerable groups.

In order to ensure the desired policy outcomes, the government should create rules of engagement that are in line with other national processes, and build partnerships with other relevant ministries, development partners and social partners. The project implementation process should be anchored in one institution such as the Ministry of Labour. Consultations at the national and sub-national levels should also be conducted.

Technical session 4: Situation analysis using diagnostic tools including matrix assessment

Ms. Dasgupta presented some of the tools available for formulating employment policy by stating that the employment policy does not only focus on the number of jobs, but also on the quality of jobs and on the principle of non-discrimination. She explained the process of the formulation; the content to be included in the policy and the way in which the policy can be implemented, monitored, and evaluated. She also made a short presentation on guidelines including the National Employment Policy Guide, ILO CEB Toolkit, Convention 122, and the Global Employment Agenda. These tools are useful in defining the contents of the employment policy. She clarified certain objectives including a review of the current situation and challenges, good labour market data, and a definition of the thematic areas that will promote the productive employment in the country. Research is very important in defining the thematic areas that should be considered during the preparation phase of the employment policy. To this end, the report titled “Cambodia: Toward a National Employment Strategy for Sustained Poverty Reduction” was completed. The report is a diagnostic analysis and needs to be linked with a strategy for employment targeting i.e. defining the strategic interventions that will contribute to reaching the set objectives. Based on this report, specific areas of interventions need to be defined, for example whether to link migration, and/or social protection and employment, and other recommendations.

The challenge is not only to increase the number of jobs, but also the number of good jobs, Ms. Dasgupta suggested. The targets can be calculated by using the number of unemployed, the number of new entrants, the number of underemployed and one third or two thirds of the working poor. She added that social protection and employment need to reinforce each other, for instance, basic social protection contributes to increased productivity, increased domestic demand, an increased tax base, increased and improved services, and better social security.

Technical Session 5: Design Employment Policy: Tools and examples from different Asian countries

Ms. Claire Harasty, Senior Employment Policy Specialist from the Employment Policy Department of the ILO Headquarters, presented the employment diagnostic analysis which was focused on the national employment policy guide, employment targeting and impact assessments.

The National Employment Policy is a common framework to formulate national employment policy. It also provides a stepwise approach to help identify various formulation phases and it can also be complemented by specific guidelines. Productive employment provides an income that can lift people above the poverty line.

The diagnostic analysis can help to explain the reasons behind a lack of productive employment. The Ministry of Labour should endeavor to understand the factors contributing to the employment situation, including the issue of youth unemployment, as well as the reasons for unemployment, be it a lack of proper skills or some other reason. In the case of the latter, the roots of the problem need to be studied in order to address them with appropriate solutions.

Ms. Harasty also discussed statistics as related to targets in national development plans concerning productive employment which serve as the main link between economic growth and poverty reduction. For example: India's target is to create 58 million new work opportunities from 2007 to 2012, Viet Nam aims to create jobs for 8 million people including 6 million new jobs between 2006 and 2010, with an annual average of 1.6 million jobs, 50% of these going to women. In Cambodia, according to National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP), the female share of wage employment has a target of reaching 50% by 2013 from a baseline of 53.5% in 2008.

In situations with a deficit of productive employment, Ms. Harasty suggested that issues relating to both the working poor and unemployment should be addressed. She explained the relationship between the labour force, the working poor, the unemployed, the deficit of productive employment, and productive employment. She observed that the problem in Cambodia is that most of the workers working in productive employment are poor. She gave the example of workers in the garment sector, as their minimum wages are not enough to lift workers out of poverty if the worker has more than one dependent. She concluded that the development of productive employment opportunities without an accompanying and significant increase in wages or minimum income (through social protection), will not be able to substantially reduce poverty. She added that non-productive employment means poverty but that productive employment does not necessarily mean absence of poverty.

Technical Session 6: Indicators for monitoring employment policies

Ms. Makiko Matsumoto, Employment Specialist from the Employment Policy Department of the ILO Headquarters, presented the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and five indicators for monitoring employment policies as follows:

- Employment Indicator 1: Concerns the employment-to-population ratio (EPR), and is very difficult to target. If EPR = 100, then the entire working age population (15+) is

employed. In high income countries the EPR= 60% to 66% but this ratio does not qualify the kind of employment/jobs.

Employment Indicator 2: Proportion of own-account and family workers in total employment. The ratio is targetable, but prior assessment and research to carefully assess the existing situation is needed. A potential weakness in this targeting method is that some wage workers may be more vulnerable than certain own-account workers.

- Employment Indicator 3: Working poverty rate as defined by the proportion of employed people living below the nationally defined poverty line to the total employment figure. This indicator may be targetable, but depending on the calculation method, the value added to monitoring the poverty rate may not be as clear.
- Employment Indicator 4: Growth in output per worker. This may be targetable but it may be easier to target its disaggregated parts.
- Employment Indicator 5: The share of women in total non-agriculture wage employment. This may be targetable but the initial analysis has to be very clear in defining the nature of non-agricultural wage employment in relation to other employment opportunities.

Other Indicators such as other Decent Work Indicators (DWIs) may be considered for monitoring, as well as indicators including average earning, earning inequality, the low pay rate, the share of wage employment in non-agriculture employment, and the time-related underemployment rate..

IV. Group Discussion :

The workshop participants were divided in four groups to discuss the employment situation in Cambodia and strategies for the future.

- Group 1: Enabling macro-environment for productive employment;
- Group 2: Job placement;
- Group 3: Income security;
- Group 4: Accessing education and vocational training;

After the discussions, each group's representative presented the results of the discussion to the plenary session. The presentations are summarized below:

Group 1: Enable the macro-environment for productive employment

To improve the macro-environment, tax relief policies for certain sectors were discussed, including:

- Garment sector and agriculture tax incentives; also policies to attract external investors to certain sectors i.e. establishing special economic zones.
- The obstacle in financing new enterprises posed by high rates of interest for consumers and companies.
- Though Cambodia's capital market will be developed with the future opening of the stock exchange, there is a lack of confidence in the banking system. Cambodians prefer

to invest their money in real estate and consumer goods (e.g. jewelry) therefore hindering the accumulation of savings deposits in local banks that could fund investment.

- Sectors of the economy with the potential to create new employment include automobile and motorcycle production; the development of agricultural processing; tourism, mining, electronic assembly, and construction, among others.
- The promotion of small and medium enterprises would require specific policies, and the construction of infrastructure, creates jobs and, combined with the effect of improved infrastructure, facilitates economic development.
- Due to the disparity between laws and their enforcement, the rule of law in Cambodia should be strengthened.
- The rice policy is an important example of how the supply of credit to the rice producing and exporting sector has contributed to an increase in productivity.
- Regarding the migration policy, while there is increasing demand for Cambodian workers in other countries, remittances should be used to generate employment through investment in small companies rather than for non-productive consumption spending.

Group 2: Job Placement: Enabling an environment for job placement and recruitment of employees

- The National Employment Agency is a new initiative focusing on job placement and currently there are five job centers located in different provinces. Job centers collect and register information on job seekers and at the time of the training 40,000 vacancies were registered.
- The system needs some improvements, including: (1)- building the capacity of the staff to collect and process data; (2)- increasing the capacity of the staff to provide career advice; (3)- public awareness raising regarding the new programme; (4)- building trust among job seekers and employers; (5)- closer collaboration with unions and employers.
- Overseas jobs: Job placement office coordinated with the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training. The Ministry of Labour coordinated both domestic and overseas job placement, through the provincial services and through the TVET institutions (39 TVET). They perform some functions through the electronic unit, the counseling unit, the library, and the liaison with the private sector unit in order to develop candidates CVs.
- The regulatory framework used by the Ministry of Labour for the placement agencies that send workers abroad: Subdecree 57 (1995) details how to monitor these agencies, the condition of the recruitment, pre-departure orientation training, etc.
- While there is better monitoring of overseas recruitment there is difficulty in the follow-up process.

Group 3: Income security while working (working sufficient hours with sufficient income)

- In the formal sector, there is a minimum wage only in the garment sector (USD \$61per month). It has been enforced (estimated 100% enforcement).
- In the public service there is no minimum wage, but rather a matrix of wages. Civil servants are not regulated, and are also not covered by labour law. Maternity leave, sick leave, paid annual leave and work injury insurance is provided under the labour law scheme.

- For the informal sector, there are some small social protection schemes for people documentedly living in poverty, such as free health care and free education, as well as a school feeding programme in rural areas (operated by the World Food Program), and a cash transfer programme for higher education.

Group 4: Accessing training and skill development

The Cambodian government has a policy to reduce poverty through 2015, elements of which are integrated into all aspects of socio-economic development. In education, the programme provides free and compulsory education for a 6-year primary education, a 3-year (grades 6-9) junior secondary school education and another 3-year (grades 9 -12) high school education before higher education. The drop-out rates at the secondary school and high school levels are very high, particularly in rural areas where students drop out after finishing junior high school (grade 9) or even earlier due to poverty.

Education and training is provided by some stakeholders, including the below:

- General Education by the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (MoEYS)
- National Skills Development Council;
- TVET system by Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT)
- Universities: University of Agriculture; Institute of Technology; etc. under the MoEYS
- NGOs and Provincial Department of Agriculture for those working in the agricultural sector

The Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training manages its TVET system in accordance with the policies below:

- Informal courses from 1- 4 months aimed at reducing poverty and providing basic skills for communities in remote areas, but the number of centers is still limited;
- Long term and formal courses for people finishing grade 9 to support the growth of industry and services, e.g.: one year programmes with a certificate of equivalence.
- Skill bridging programmes to help people who did not complete grade 9 in order to give them access to formal courses.

Under the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training, there are 24 centers, located in 24 cities/provinces. The Governing Board is comprised of two levels:

- National Tripartite Training Board is the platform used to combine the development of education policies with policies relating to standards, qualifications and skill training.
- Provincial Training Board is normally under the chair of the Governor, but it is not very active as of this workshop.

Many training centers are currently owned by the private sector while only some are owned by NGOs and the state. Scholarships to enroll in courses are very important for people living in poverty. The key sectors providing job opportunities currently are tourism, garment and agriculture. Construction and services are also important.

Both during and in the aftermath of the global economic crisis, the Special Fund created by the Cambodian Prime Minister has been a very important and direct tool in addressing the effects of the crisis. Some laid-off workers and new entrants to the labour force have received

technical and financial support in the form of training services and microloans to run small businesses in both urban and rural areas.

The provisions of the labour law have defined providing apprenticeships as an obligation of privately-owned enterprises, with a stipulation that apprenticeships represent a given percentage of their employees, or that the enterprises pay the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training annually for training and apprenticeship provision. The national qualification system was developed between the general educational system and TVET. National Competency Standards and credits are awarded through training courses. The main fields of study are construction, businesses, and mechanics, all managed by the Tripartite Governing Board.

In Cambodia, there is a disparity between the academic qualifications of young people entering the labour market and the job opportunities provided by the prevailing socio-economic situation. While management and accounting are popular university degrees, the labour market has a high demand for technical skills at all levels. Government subsidies allowing people with limited economic means to pursue medium and low technical skills training courses are crucial in rebalancing supply and demand in Cambodia's labour market.

The group also provided some recommendations as listed below:

- 1) TVET should extend its programme as a series of training courses in collaboration with the private sector, into areas including agriculture, hospitality, tourism, industry, etc.
- 2) Access to TVET training should be increased at the district or commune level
- 3) In addition to providing allowances for training, financial credits to support the creation of small businesses would aid this segment of the economy
- 4) The labour market surveillance system should be established. Cambodia's labour market should be defined and quantified.
- 5) A monitoring and evaluation mechanism to examine the impact of TVET should be established.
- 6) Linkages between training and the labour market should be established, by setting up a system to conduct surveys on employment and unemployment, whose information should be sent to TVET systematically for analysis.

Conclusion of Day 1

After active participation on the part of the attendees during the full-day sessions, Mr. Helmut Schwarzer concluded the session and thanked the participants for their excellent contributions through sharing information from their institutions, and active discussions, also reminding them about the second and third days of the training.

DAY 2

Technical Session 7: Social Protection in Asia

Ms. Valérie Schmitt, Social Security Specialist for the ILO Decent Work Team in Bangkok presented the social protection situation in Asia. She defined social security, described the current situation in Asia, and discussed the strategies for the extension of social security.

Ms. Schmitt began by explaining the nine contingencies of a person's life cycle including maternity, sickness/illness, unemployment, work injury, children, invalidity, death of bread winner and old age. She gave a briefing on an analysis on social security in 39 Asian countries where only 31% of the population received old age pension, a figure far lower than the world average of 40%. Additionally, the level of social protection in terms of health is at 51.6% of the population; however this includes China with 94.6% coverage. Without China, the percentage falls to only 22.5%. She explained that most countries in Asia have comprehensive social security for formal sector and while the coverage for the informal sector and those living in poverty has been developed, these programmes are scattered and not well coordinated. She also compared the situations in Cambodia, Indonesia and Thailand, which have similar social protection and social security schemes.

As part of the strategy for the extension of social security coverage, Ms. Schmitt explained the "social security staircase". Based on the expansion of both the horizontal and vertical dimensions of social security, Ms. Schmitt also discussed the introduction of the social protection floor initiative, using the example of the four guarantees of the social protection floor, namely, 1) all residents should have access to essential health care, 2) all children should enjoy income security through transfers in cash or in kind and be able to access nutrition, education and care, 3) all those in active age groups who cannot earn sufficient income should enjoy minimum income security (facilitated through transfers in cash or in kind and employment guarantee schemes) and 4) all elderly or disabled residents should have income security through pensions or transfers in kind.

With the aid of the ILO technical assistance, the social security staircase was incorporated into the National Social Protection Strategy in Cambodia (NSPS) and the five NSPS objectives reflected the four guarantees of the social protection floor (Basic Social Protection in the NSPS).

Ms. Schmitt also shared the experiences of several other countries in extending social security coverage, citing the examples of schemes in India, China, Indonesia, Laos, Thailand, Viet Nam and possibilities for Cambodia to do the same.

The key messages from the presentation can be summarized as follows: that the extension of social security is both a priority and a necessity, that the extension of social security should follow a two-dimensional approach and the social security staircase methodology, and that Cambodia has started extending social security through the establishment of a variety of schemes, including the National Social Security Fund (NSSF), National Social Security Fund for Civil Servants (NSSF-C), the Health Equity Funds (HEFs), Community Based Health Insurance (CBHI) and the development of the National Social Protection Strategy for the Poor and Vulnerable.

Ms. Schmitt also presented the seven ILO tools to extend social security and discussed some activities in Asia, as noted below:

- 1- The promotion of Social Protection Floors, the Social Security Staircase and Social Security Standards
- 2- Support for the design of National Social Protection Strategies
- 3- Diagnostic analysis of the social security situation and some recommendations
- 4- Methodology for the calculation of social security and social protection scheme costs

- 5- Support for the design and implementation of schemes
- 6- Building capacity and awareness
- 7- Developing partnerships: SPF Team, IWGs, among others

Technical Session 8: ILO Key conventions and recommendations to serve as a benchmark and to provide guidance in the design of social security scheme and the Social Protection Floor

Mr. Helmut Schwarzer presented the ILO mandate on social security and introduced the ILO's main tools in pursuing its mandate, including the international labour standards, Convention 188, and Recommendations 199. He gave a briefing on the up-to-date ILO conventions on social security, namely, C. 102 on Social Security (Minimum Standards), C. 121 on Employment Injury Benefits, C. 128 on Old-Age, Invalidity and Survivors' Benefits, C. 130 on Medical Care Benefits, C. 168 on Unemployment Benefits, C. 183 on Maternity Benefits, C. 118 on Equality of Treatment in Social Security and C. 157 on Maintenance of Migrant Workers Rights. He explained the details of Convention 102, the flagship convention on social security, and discussed the nine branches of social security, re-emphasizing the four guarantees of social security schemes.

Mr. Schwarzer also shared the results of the discussion on social protection at the ILC (June 2011): consensus on social security for all, consensual support for the Social Protection Floor and the bi-dimensional strategy to extend coverage (vertical and horizontal dimensions), the endorsement of the ILO Standards on Social Security (C. 102 and others), agenda setting for a new recommendation on the SPF for 2012, and the endorsement of the ILO mandate to technically assist the member states on social protection policies.

V. Sharing sessions with government institutions

1. H.E Sann Vathana: Situation analysis and the way forward on social protection in Cambodia

H.E Mr. Sann Vathana, Deputy Secretary General of Council for Agricultural and Rural Development, presented an analysis of the current situation and the possible next steps for social protection in Cambodia. He stressed that social protection is not an expense or social safety net, but rather an investment to alleviate poverty, increase aggregate demand and to develop human capital. He briefly explained the five objectives of the National Social Protection Strategy (NSPS) and the concept of social security staircase embedded in the strategy. He also explained that the issue of employment forms part of the NSPS and the national development plan. The linkage between employment and social protection is crucial for sustainable poverty reduction and for an approach which aims to support the life cycle of the population. However, there are several different intervention schemes administered by development partners, NGOs as well as various ministries which should be integrated into the NSPS. A guiding principle for the implementation of each programme under the NSPS has been introduced in order to integrate existing programmes in the country, including the Health Equity Fund (HEF), child support programmes, food aid programmes, climate change policy, and employment policy. Mr. Vathana expressed his expectation that under the guiding principle, each of these programmes will be piloted and scaled up, becoming core strategies by 2015.

2. Mr. Chuop Narath, Deputy Director of the General Department of Labour, MoLVT

Mr. Chuop Narath presented the six priorities of the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training's action plan (2009-2013). One of the priorities is job creation. Six strategic plans were presented: 1) employment development within the country, 2) employment development outside the country, 3) decent work development in the informal sector, 4) the creation of a standard for labour inspectors, 5) the establishment of a labour institute and 6) the creation of labour market information system regarding both supply and demand. Some actors concerned with the same employment issues as the MoLVT were discussed, including the National Employment Agency, as well as private recruitment agencies that send workers abroad, provide pre-departure training, and private recruitment agencies' orientation centres. The informal sector also presents challenges for employment policy, for instance hygiene conditions, as well as small companies need to be listed and classified so that vulnerable employment and working conditions can be identified.

3. Mr. TEP OEUN, Deputy Director General, Directorate General for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET), MoLVT

Mr. Tep Oeun shared challenges and issues relating to the TVET system, development policy and planning, as well as the outcomes of TVET in Cambodia. He began by discussing the goal of TVET and education more broadly, which aims to reduce poverty, aid people in creating their own employment, and increase productivity, through stable employment and the resulting increase in income.

The two focal points of the TVET policy are poverty reduction and establishment of human capital. Poverty reduction can be achieved in the short term through training courses in rural areas aiding people in creating their own employment. The development of human capital for use in the industrial sector will involve providing skills training. Formal training courses will provide certificates upon completion, similar to other diplomas and educational certifications. Aside from these formal training courses, non formal training courses have been conducted in Cambodia, for example, Samdech Hun Sen's (the Cambodian Prime Minister) special fund for laid off workers during the global economic crisis had several training programmes including the voucher skill training programme, a skills bridging programme for those who left school after grades 7 or 8, a special training for members of indigenous groups, and additionally a National Training Fund which facilitates requests for support in post-harvest technology training (important because there is a need for training on storage, packaging and processing of agricultural products), and a factory apprenticeship training programmes. A bridging system between formal/ general education and vocational training is also available.

The National Training Board (NTB) is setting up national policies, governance and accountability structures comprised of the Executive Committee, namely the Director General of TVET and the National Employment Agency, as well as Sub-Technical Committees like the Accreditation Committee, the Skills Standards Development Committee, the Labour Market Information Committee, the Quality Assurance Group/Auditor, and the Independent Assessment Group. Additionally provincial training boards also exist in each province, for example provincial services for labour and vocational training, and provincial training centers.

Though intervention programmes do exist, Mr. Oeun discussed some of the challenges in making TVET responsive to the needs of the labour market. In illustrating the disparity between labour market supply and demand, he spoke about how young people graduating from

university find it very hard to secure jobs due to the fact that their skills do not reflect the real needs of the market, and the fact that the current education system is not flexible enough to meet the labour market's demands. Furthermore, Mr. Oeun mentioned that most university-educated Cambodians prefer intellectual work to skilled labour.

In order to improve the TVET system in Cambodia, Mr. Oeun recommended creating a better partnership with the private sector as cooperation remains limited and discrimination is still an issue during the recruitment of students. Some external issues also present problems, like population growth in the face of a limited job market, skills discrimination, and a lack of funding for TVET programmes, among others. Economic growth is another issue, as is the absence of specific regulation on the management of labour market, as well as teachers/trainers still limited in their use of new technology. Statistics have shown that after finishing high school, 50% of students enroll in universities, 17% go on to training courses, and approximately 30% seek employment.

Additionally, internal factors have effects on the labour market, for example the lack of a national qualification framework, a skills competencies standard and skill testing, the inability to attract in sufficient numbers those who need skills training (the unemployed, under-employed, disadvantaged and drop-outs), an inadequate number of qualified TVET personnel, weak leadership and management, poor communication and marketing, inadequate and inappropriate teaching/learning materials, equipment and environment, unequal access, limited public-private partnership.

4- Mr. Chiev Bunnarith, National Social Security Fund (NSSF)

Mr. Chiev Bunnarith, the chief of the policy division of the NSSF, MoLVT, presented relevant laws and regulations on social security in Cambodia, the implementation of the social security system, work-injury insurance and benefits, the challenges to implementation and the strategic plan of the NSSF.

The implementation of Cambodia's social security system is bound by the country's constitution, labour laws, and the law on social security for those encompassed by the labour laws, the Prime Minister's regulation "sub-decree" and several other ministerial regulations "Prakas". In addition, the government's Rectangular Strategy also defines the step by step implementation of the system. The first stage is the work-related injury insurance, the second is health insurance and the third is the pension system.

Mr. Bunnarith, presented the current work-injury insurance to provide a clear definition of the scheme and its benefits. At the same time, he also shared the challenges that NSSF has faced so far, for instance the lack of understanding of the claims process on behalf of workers, late reporting from employers, the limited quality of health care providers, member identification issues and unsafe transport services. Mr. Bunnarith complemented that NSSF had expanded its services to national wide and is planning to introduce social health insurance by 2013.

5- Mr. Saneth Vathna, Deputy Director of the Ministry of Social Affairs and Youth Rehabilitation (MoSVY)

Mr. Vathna presented the basic grounds for preparation of the law on social security as defined in Article 36 of Cambodian Constitution, namely that all citizens should have access to social security benefits. A letter from the Cambodian prime minister on the Elderly Day in October 2010 also encouraged the development of the law on social security for Cambodian citizens.

In response to the MoSVY's action plan for 2008-2013, a working group and secretariat to draft legislation on social security for Cambodian citizens was established. The draft law is composed of nine charters and 56 articles. It was submitted to a consultation workshop in late 2010 and incorporated to the financial development strategy of the Cambodian government for 2011-2015.

Mr. Vathna claimed that the provisions of this draft law are still broad and its implementation should be followed by sub-decree and Prakas. The Ministry also faced a lack of human capacity in the working group responsible for drafting the law and needs additional technical assistance from development partners.

6- Mr. Meas Vou, Deputy Director of the National Social Security Fund for Civil Servants (NSSFC)

Mr. Vou began by giving a briefing on the background of the social security system for civil servants. Destroyed by the civil war from 1970-1979, the system was reestablished in 1985. A royal decree on social security for civil servants was passed by the King in January 2008, followed by a sub-decree to introduce the National Social Security Fund for Civil Servants in February 2008. NSSFC is an autonomous institution under the technical supervision of Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation (MoSVY) and the financial supervision of the Ministry of Economy and Finance and operates under eleven board directors representing different ministries and one director responsible for day-to-day activities.

NSSF-C provides six benefits to its members including pensions, maternity leave, work injury, survivors' pensions, in addition to illness and life insurance. Currently NSSF-C is working on a health insurance scheme for civil servants. Though the scheme is fairly recent, Mr. Vou discussed some of the challenges faced and a plan for next steps to improve the capacity of the NSSF-C's staff, its management and information systems and its collaboration with development partners.

Group Discussion

A "Jeopardy game" based on the social protection floor initiative was introduced by Ms. Diane Taieb, a consultant, and by Ms. Valérie Schmitt, the ILO Social Security Specialist. The participants were divided into 4 groups and each group was required to select a representative. The representatives chose a number, and he or she read the corresponding question to his or her team, and following a consultation, the team gave its answer. If the answer was correct, the team "earned" budget money to implement Social Protection Provisions. The following questions were asked:

- 1- Which of the following is not a mechanism contributing to the provision of basic social health protection in the Social Protection Floor framework?

Answer: Voluntary private insurance

- 2- China has been able to provide social health protection for 94.6% of its population; does this mean that the first guarantee of the floor has been achieved?
Answer: Not yet, because we have no guarantee that the benefit package is adequate
- 3- Why does a health social protection system have to be implemented step by step?
Answer: Because the economic and epidemiologic conditions can change and make the further developments of social health protection programmes necessary.
- 4- Give the names of the existing social health protection schemes in Cambodia.
Answer: Health Equity Funds, Community Based Health Insurance, National Social Security Fund for Formal Sector Workers (under preparation)
- 5- The Health Equity Fund (HEF) reimburses health services providers for treating patients who are classified as too poor to pay. Which of the following is NOT an implementation gap?
Answer: The package offered does not include ARVs (this constitutes a legal gap)
- 6- What percentage of the social health expenditure in Cambodia is dependent on donors?
Answer : 40%
- 7- Provide four recommendations with aims to ensure access to essential health care services for all people in Cambodia?
Answer: Extend the coverage of HEFs to all the poor, extend the coverage of the HEF to all working in the informal economy, increase the benefits package of the HEF - indicate which health care services should be added, ensure that the services included in the HEF package are available in all health care centers.
- 8- In order to progressively implement the social protection floor, it is necessary:
Answer: To establish a social dialogue with all stakeholders involved to agree on priorities.
- 9- What is NOT a **sufficient** predictor of child vulnerability?
Answer: Being an orphan or raised in a single-parent household
- 10- The second MDG (Universal access to education) is likely to be achieved by 2015 in (excluding China and India):
Answer: 8 of the 19 countries of south east, north east and northern Asia
- 11- Conditional cash-transfers have proven to efficiently provide income support to the families as well as ensuring primary school enrolment and preventative health care. The non fulfillment of the conditionality (school enrolment and health care utilization) is a good indicator of a lack of supply of health and education services.
Answer: True
- 12- Provide four recommendations aimed at ensuring income security for children so that they can access education, nutrition and health care in Cambodia?

Answer: Establish a conditional cash transfer scheme, provide systematic free school meals in rural areas and take home rations, expand re-entry and non-formal education programmes to all rural areas, expand compulsory education up to the 12th grade, expand the apprenticeship programme for children between ages 15 and 18.

13- Which one is false?

To assess whether income support at poverty line level in Cambodia is guaranteed, we should look at:

Answer: Short-time projects put in place after the financial crisis

14- Which country does not have an unemployment insurance system?

Answer: Cambodia

15- How would you calculate the income provided by the Public Works Programmes?

Answer: Any of the propositions above.

16- The internal migrant workers in Cambodia are not covered by the Health Equity Funds (HEF).

Which one(s) of the following explanation is/are true?

Answer: Because the HEFs are not harmonized at national level, because there is no central database of beneficiaries, because the identification through the ID-Poor is done only in rural areas, and because it is difficult to assess people's vulnerability.

17- Which ministries and agencies should be involved in the provision of income security measures (in case of sickness, maternity, unemployment, underemployment, and work-related injury) for the working age population in Cambodia?

Answer: MoSVY, MoLVT, Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Interior, CARD, NSSF NSSF-C

18- Provide four recommendations aiming to ensure income security (in case of sickness, maternity, unemployment, underemployment, and work-related injury) for the working age population?

Answer : Design and establish a maternity benefit programme for female workers in the informal economy, establish a public works programme in rural areas, ensure that all underemployed in rural areas have access to appropriate TVET and/or private training programmes, provide financial and technical support for the creation of micro-enterprises after the completion of vocational training.

19- Which one(s) of the following proposition(s) is/are true?

The introduction of a universal old age pension in Cambodia is...

Answer: Relevant because, when receiving a minimum pension, the elderly invest in the future of their grandchildren. ... relevant, because the elderly can more easily participate in community activities when receiving a minimum pension.

20- An analysis on 39 countries in Asia and the Pacific shows that only 31% of the elderly receive a pension. This is lower than the world's average (40%).

Answer: True

21- Does the provision of a lump sum upon retirement offer adequate protection?

Answer: No

22- Provide four recommendations aimed at ensuring income security for the elderly in Cambodia.

Answer: Implementation of a pension fund for civil servants, establishment of a pension fund for private sector employees, the design and establishment of a non-contributory, universal old age pension for informal economy workers, establishment of voluntary and subsidized savings accounts in addition to basic old age pensions.

DAY 3

Technical Session 9: The need for coherence and coordination between employment and social protection, fiscal policy, societal vision

Mr. Helmut Schwarzer discussed coordination between social protection and employment promotion, stressing that in addition to financial resources aimed at reducing poverty, services can also change families' living conditions. Therefore, it is very important to coordinate social protection and employment policies. Some databases can be well coordinated in order to manage policies, monitor and efficiently evaluate the impacts of the policies' implementation. He added that "PEOPLE Service" is a project that fits this description.

The coordination of policies like NSSF, NSSF-C is possible and requires that good and institutional relation between social security institutions, the tax inspection system and the OSH be developed. The three inspection systems have different cultures and different rules and well need a careful approximation.

Similarly to some key economic sectors, social protection schemes will have forward and backward linkages with the rest of the economy. The forward linkages of social protection are human capital building, income generation, fiscal linkages, social cohesion and stability, whereas the backward linkages can be seen in the generation of jobs in social services (and a large share of female employment), social protection policies setting standards that promote adherence to decent work standards, and the positive effects of social transfers and services on private markets (including the possibility that cash transfers set a reference for minimum wages).

Mr. Schwarzer shared some experiences from Latin America with the social protection floor programmes and regarding coordination, spoke about the examples of the Conditional Cash Transfer schemes in Brazil (Bolsa Família) and in Mexico (Oportunidades), non-contributory pensions, social assistance pensions, universal benefit (Bolivia), rural pensions (Brazil), innovations in health services, universal health in Brazil, the Regimen Subsidiado in Colombia, the integration of benefits with services by the programmes SUAS (Brazil), Chile Protege, Vivir Mejor (Mexico) and the Plan Equidad (Uruguay), as well as the integration of contributory and non-contributory benefits as it is the case with the Chilean solidaric pension and the Argentinean child benefit (Asignación Universal por Hijo).

Technical session 10: Rapid assessment protocol. Methodology and experience - relevance for Cambodia

Ms. Valérie Schmitt, the Bangkok based ILO Social Security Specialist, once again explained the assessment methodology, some concrete examples of countries where an assessment has been conducted or is in the works, main achievements of the ILO thus far and the relevance of the assessment to Cambodia.

First she explained the assessment matrix, noting how it is used to perform an inventory of schemes in order to identify gaps and implementation issues, and also to provide recommendations for improvement. Second, Ms. Schmitt presented the RAP Protocol, explaining its use into collecting data for the costing, translating recommendations into scenarios and providing costing estimates for the recommendations. Lastly, the assessment matrix can be used for the finalization of the assessment report, its translation, and discussion with policy makers in order to facilitate decision making regarding the next steps.

Ms. Schmitt shared the assessment matrix and results of the costing exercise using the RAP protocol for schemes in Thailand, Viet Nam and Indonesia. She also explained possible ways in which Cambodia can apply this methodology to the current situation. She stressed that Cambodia would not have to start from scratch as the inventory of its social security and social protection schemes, the situation analysis, the coverage indicators and benefits levels, as well as the background documents have already been included in the SPER.

Sharing session:

H.E Dr. Sann Vathana: Linking social protection and employment

H.E Dr. Sann Vathana, Deputy Secretary General of Council for Agricultural and Rural Development (CARD) conducted a presentation on possible linkages between social protection and employment policies. He explained that people with low education normally face difficulty finding jobs while those with higher education levels often face a disparity between their skills and the labour market. From the perspective of social protection he questioned how it can be linked to employment policy before explaining that this linkage forms an important part of the work of a variety of actors in the field of social protection and requires efficient coordination.

The Cambodian government has expressed its expectation that by 2015 all those living in poverty and in vulnerable situations will be covered by the five objectives of NSPS (emergency response, PWP, cash transfers, health care, elimination of child labour and the response to the needs of special vulnerable groups). Therefore, from 2011 to 2015, an estimate of the number of persons to be covered by the schemes is needed. In an informal estimate, the scheme will cover 1.5 million people affected by the recent floods, 100,000 pregnant mothers, 1.7 million children, 2.0 million working age people, 4.0 million people to be covered by health care and groups needing social protection including 200,000 elderly, 100,000 disabled people, and 100,000 members of ethnic groups.

Dr. Vathana claimed that with social protection packages, the government expected that people living in poverty and in vulnerable conditions will be lifted over the poverty line by 2015 and that some of them can enter formal or public sector employment where their social security will be covered by NSSF or NSSFC. He also raised Jean Jacques Rousseau's theory of "social contract" to explain the obligation of citizens to share their resources in a country via the social security system.

In addition, Dr. Vathana reviewed the development trends of countries in southern and eastern Asia as compared to Cambodia and also provided some approaches on the integration between social protection and employment policy in Cambodia. For instance, he recommended a review of the role of the commune councils' link to district councils, an examination of vocational training centres and potential contractor/ private sector links through a specific programme providing a coherent framework for the implementation of the NSPS and eliminating disjointed interventions, (towards integration of scattered interventions), the development of synergies between the components of the NSPS, potential methods for reducing costs (shared administrative tasks: registration, vulnerability assessment, skills assessment, monitoring and evaluation), the facilitation of the establishment of a monitoring and evaluation system (registration and the monitoring of memberships, utilization rates, payments, implementation of each programme, as well as the evaluation of the programmes' impact), and an increase in access to information for beneficiaries in addition to facilitating the required administrative procedures.

Ms. Claire Harasty: Cambodia National Employment Strategy and the linkages with social protection

Ms. Claire Harasty, the Senior ILO Employment Policy Specialist, discussed ideas within the policy areas upon which the national employment policy could focus. She defined the National Employment Policy as a vision and a concerted and coherent policy framework linking policy interventions and stakeholders in pursuit of a common target as defined by employment policy objectives, the most important objective of which is the full and productive employment for all men and women. Ms. Harasty discussed some of the interventions, including the Conditional Cash Transfer programme, community based training, and the use of TVET for improving skills. Micro-credit schemes and employment funds can also be very useful tools for investing in small and medium sized enterprises, informal enterprises, and the agricultural sector. The Public Works Programme can also contribute to the development of infrastructure.

In conclusion, Ms. Harasty re-emphasized that effective employment policy implementation means moving people out of poverty towards more sustainable jobs and higher incomes, facilitating movement up the social security staircase.

H.E Dr. Sann Vathana and Ms. Valérie Schmitt: Towards an integrated approach

Lastly, H.E Dr. Sann Vathana and Ms. Valérie Schmitt jointly presented the ideas on the integration of existing social protection programmes. The objective of this approach is to establish a social protection floor and a gradual progression towards higher social protection coverage. They demonstrated the way to move from non-contributory system of social security to a contributory system of social insurance. The linkage of social protection and employment services is crucial in helping those living in poverty or vulnerable situations towards a gradual upward progression. As an example, those living in poverty or vulnerable situations can access basic social protection and when able to secure jobs, they will receive more income, generating greater sustainability for their family, thus contributing to increased access to employment, where accompanying higher levels of income and social protection can be achieved.

The proposed PEOPLE Service has been discussed as a mechanism to implement the linkage of social protection and employment policy through a single window service office where the beneficiaries can register for a variety of services including health care, cash transfer

programmes, school feeding, scholarships, public work programmes, vocational training, job center and social security, among others. The function of PEOPLE Service is to increase outreach, update the information management system, and to create and develop coordination and linkages at the local level. Some options for the structure of the proposed linkage between the local community level and the national level have already been discussed.

At the end of the training seminar, the 2nd group discussion was arranged as the following:

Group Discussion: The participants were divided in four groups to discuss four scenarios of the PEOPLE Service in different geographical regions:

Group 1: Discuss in the context of a rural area in Siem Reap province

Group 2: Discuss in the context of the urban areas of Siem Reap province

Group 3: Discuss in the context Poipet district, Banteay Meanchey province

Group 4: Discuss in the context of a rural area in Kampot province.

The results of the discussions were presented by each group and are summarized below:

Group 1: PEOPLE Service in a rural area of Siem Reap province:

The group suggested that the PEOPLE Service office cover two or three communes in a district and the office should be responsible for the collection of contributions, the registration of beneficiaries, and informing the central database managed by CARD. The group suggested CARD manage the database due to the limited capacity of ministries and with an eye to maximizing resources by using the same database system. Also, it may be easier to find development partners if the system is managed by CARD. This project will primarily target the national and sub-national levels. CARD would serve as a decision maker, providing training to staff/commune council officials and managing overall coordination. All the reporting mechanisms would proceed from commune to district, from district to province and province to the national level. The group thought that the Ministry of Economy and Finance should allocate the budget to establish the PEOPLE Service in two to three communes or to perhaps consider a mobile PEOPLE Service using van that would stay for four to five days in each commune.

The group recommended that PEOPLE Service offices should exist at the district level; however, they recognized the need to ensure outreach through good communication at the commune level giving appropriate access to information.

Group 2: PEOPLE Service in urban areas of Siem Reap province

The group suggested that the role of the PEOPLE Service should be to register those living in poverty and vulnerable situations, make a vulnerability assessment, link existing social protection schemes like HEF, CBHI, school meals and take home rations, information sharing on job availability and information on migration as well as training for mothers on nutrition and education.

The group suggested the project works closely with the Technical Provincial Committee (TPC) and provincial governors responsible for social protection, with the programme to be implemented by commune councils, district committees under the direct supervision of TPC. The provincial training committee, social security institutions and the Supreme National

Economic Council (SNEC) would monitor the provision of services. In terms of finance, the group also suggested fund allocation from the Ministry of Economy and Finance and development partners and that there should be an institution responsible for the monitoring and management of the database like CARD.

Group 3: PEOPLE service in the Poipet district of the Banteay Meanchey province:

The group suggested that it would be good to have an office in Sangkat Poipet because there is a similar programme there called “Social Service” with well trained staff. The PEOPLE Service should install a hotline telephone service and front desk staff who could explain the services provided. The office would also be responsible for sharing information on the necessary procedures to obtain services, in close collaboration with the village chief, the health centre, the social affairs office and others as needed in order to facilitate registration and access to services. Support for the collection of fees could be obtained by adequately explaining the benefits of their contribution. However the group recommended that the staff did not collect fees themselves in order to avoid confusion about the role of the office and reduce the risk of corruption. The group also advised that the office be independent and that the commune council be transparent. The idea of sharing financial resources between the commune /Sangkat fund and MEF was also proposed.

Group 4: PEOPLE service in a rural area of Kampot province:

This group suggested that the PEOPLE Service should be located in rural and urban areas of Kampot. This office should have five main functions: 1) to register the service providers and service recipients, 2) to disseminate information on social protection, 3) to assess what should be included in social protection and what services are needed, 4) to facilitate SME development, 5) to link to all providers of services including HEF, school meals and take home rations. This group also suggested that design takes place at a national level due to issues of capacity but in consultation with actors at a sub-national level. The commune councils should implement the project with development partners, however the decision making should be done by the commune because they have all necessary information and at the provincial level as well due to their budgetary responsibilities. The group added that staff training should be the responsibility of the ministries and of the development partners.

In conclusion, the group thought that establishing the PEOPLE Service was a good idea to help reduce duplicated work and cost. However they stressed that the provision of services must be transparent, that staff should be trained properly on anticorruption, and that an internal monitoring and evaluation system should be created.

VI. Evaluation:

After 3 days of active attendance, all participants were requested to fill in an evaluation form of the training workshop in order to assess the level of understanding of contents of the training, the organisation of the training, logistical arrangement and to solicit suggestions for improvement.

Overall, participants were very appreciative of the training and expressed that they felt the contents matched their institutional needs, especially as Cambodia has recently endorsed the National Social Protection Strategy and is developing a national employment policy. Participants found the discussion how to implement the NSPS to be particularly useful. The below is the result of the evaluation from 25 participants on the last day of the training workshop:

Evaluation

Rating	Very Good	Good	Fair	Bad
Contents of the training workshop	18/25	7/25		
Selected subjects are of interest to the participants/ institutions	16/25	9/25		
The contents are well presented and informative	21/25	4/25		
Contents useful for your daily work	11/25	9/25	5/25	
Understanding of the basic ILO Diagnostic Tools for designing Employment Policy and indicators for monitoring employment policy	12/25	8/25	5/25	
Understanding of the design and implementation of social protection policies and schemes	15/25	7/25	3/25	
Understanding of the tools to integrate employment policy and social protection	10/25	12/25	3/25	
Participants were provided enough time to share their views and for Q & A	17/25	6/25	2/25	
Group work is participatory approach	20/25	5/25		
Overall rating for the training	16/25	9/25		
Organization of the training	19/25	6/25		
Duration of the training: 3 days	17/25	8/25		
Workshop facilities (training room)	20/25	5/25		
Logistical arrangement	21/25	4/25		
Overall rating for logistical arrangements	20/25	5/25		
Suggestions for improvement:				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide more trainings in order to more deeply understand the social protection system and employment policy in other countries - Provide all materials in advance - Give more time to discuss and for Q & A - The next training should not be too long as participants are very busy in their daily work 				

ANNEXES

Annex 1: List of Attendance

List of Attendance
Training Workshop on Diagnostic Tools/Extending Social Protection and Promoting
Employment
02-04 November 2011, Phnom Penh Hotel, Cambodia

No.	Title	Name	Position	Organization	Telephone	Email
1	Mr.	Chap Rithy	Under-Secretary of State	MoLVY	092 677798	
2	Mr.	Hou Vudthy	Deputy Director General	MoLVT	012 911 695	
3	Mr.	Phann Kim	Chief of Bureau	NFV, MoSVY	012 374485	phannkim@yahoo.com
4	Mr.	Sok Chhun Oeung	Vice President	IDEA	012 71 66 53	oeungchhun@yahoo.com
5	Mr.	Ouk Sisovann	Senior Programme Officer	ILO/IPEC	012 811 399	sisovann@ilo.org
6	Ms	Kay Thalin	HR Assistant	CCF	012 400 590	kaythaline@gmail.com
7	Mr.	Sok Kin	Vice President	BWTUC	012 736 270	sok-kinbwtuc@yahoo.com
8	Mr.	Sann Vannary	Admin Officer	Zuelling Pharma	088 7270 888	vsann@zuellingpharma.com
9	Mr.	Chuop Narath	Deputy Director	MoLVT	012 218 789	
10	Mr.	Vincent Vire	Education Advisor	EU	023 216 996	vincent-vire@eeas.europa.eu
11	Ms.	Sim Hong	Deputy Director	MoLVT	012 909 553	
12	Mr.	Ly Vanna	Officer	NSSF	016 36 33 35	vannaly-vn@yahoo.com
13	Mr.	Norng Chan Borin	Accountant & Admin	ACRA	097 37 38 039	acramanpower@gmail.com
14	Mr.	Kong Chanthy	CARD-SPCU Officer	CARD	099 79 89 99	
15	Mr.	Ouk Ravuth	Officer	MoLVT	012 28 98 61	ouk.ravuth@yahoo.com
16	Mr.	Meas Vou	Deputy Director	NSSFC	012 78 73 45	youmeas@yahoo.com
17	Mr.	Saneth Vathna	Deputy Director General	MoSVY	012 56 50 22	sanethvathana@yahoo.com
18	Mr.	Khin Sosamrach	Assistant to DG	MoLVT	012 73 5131	sosamrach@gmail.com
19	Ms	Ouch Vannak	Assistant Organizer	ILO	011 745 741	ouchvannak@yahoo.com
20	Mr.	Helmut Schwarzer	CTA	ILO-EU		schwazer@ilo.org
21	Ms.	Valérie Schmitt	Social Security Specialist	ILO-DWT	+41 22 7997619	schmittv@ilo.org

22	Ms.	Makiko Matsumoto	Employment Policy Specialist	ILO	+4122 7996457	matsumoto@ilo.org
23	Mr.	Claire Harasty	Senior Specialist	ILO	+4122 799 7865	harastry@ilo.org
24	Ms.	Diane Taieb	Consultant	ILO		diane.taieb@essec.com
25	Mr.	Sann Vathana	Deputy Secretary General	CARD		vathana20@yahoo.com
26	Mr.	Oum Visal	Political	C-CAWDU		
27	Ms.	Sukti Dasgupta	Senior Employment Policy			dasgupta@ilo.org
28	Mr.	Hong Choeun	Head Ranking	NEA		
29	Mr.	Sou Ratha	Social Protection Assistant	CARD, SPCU		rathasou@yahoo.com
30	Mr.	Sou Phalla	Officer	MoLVT	012 88 38 55	
31	Ms.	Maeve Galvin	Communication Officer	ILO		galvin@ilo.org
32	Ms.	Ok Malika	National Programme Officere	ILO-EU	016 872 703	malika@ilo.org
33	Mr.	Tep Oeun	Dep. Director General	MoLVT		
34	Mr.	Ath Sopisal	Officer	MoLVT	athsopisal@yahoo.com	016 40 16 36
35	Mr.	Tun Sophorn	National Coordinator	ILO		tun@ilo.org
36	Ms.	Nou Pheary	Prog. Officer	ILO-SPG		pheary@ilo.org
37	Mr.	Meas Vou	Dep. Director	NSSFC	012 787 345	
38	Ms.	Undraa Suren	Manager	ILO-SPG		suren@ilo.org
39	Mr.	Pongsul Ahn	Worker's Specialist	ILO-DWT		ahn@ilo.org
40	Mr.	Cheav Bunrith	Director of Policy Unit	NSSF		chaev-bunrith@yahoo.com
41	Mr.	Dong Chandara	Dept. of office	NSSF		
42	Ms.	Gloria	UNV	ILO-SPG		anglo@ilo.org
43	Ms.	Hong Muy	DG Assistant	MoLVT		

Annex II Programme of the training

Training Workshop on Diagnostic Tools/ Extending Social Protection and Promoting Employment Phnom Penh Hotel, November 02-04th, 2011

TENTATIVE AGENDA

Day 1: Wednesday 2 November		
08:30-09:00	Registration of participants	
09:00-09:25	Opening Session: - Welcome remarks: Mr. Helmut Schwarzer , new ILO-EU Project,CTA - Opening Address: H.E Chap Rithy , Under Secretary of State of MoLVT	Mr. Helmut Schwarzer (ILO) MoLVT
09:25-09:35	Introduction programme of the training	MC (MoLVT)
09:35-10:00	Introduction of participants Tools and methods for the design and implementation of employment and social protection policies and systems	Mr. Helmut Schwarzer (ILO)
Designing and implementing employment policies		
10:00-10:45	Employment in Asia Q&A	Ms. Sukti Dasgupta (ILO)
15 minutes	PAUSE CAFE	
11:00-11:45	ILO key conventions and recommendations to serve as a benchmark and to provide guidance in the design of employment policies Q&A	Ms. Clarie Harasty (ILO)
11:45-12:00	Situation analysis using diagnostic tools (including “Towards employment security: assessment matrix”) Q&A	Ms. Sukti Dasgupta
12:00-12:45	Designing employment policies: tools and examples from different Asian countries Q&A	Ms. Claire Harasty Ms. Sukti Dasgupta
1 hour	LUNCH	
13:45-14:30	Indicators for monitoring employment policies Q&A	Ms. Makiko Matsumoto
14:30-17:15	The employment situation & way forward in Cambodia: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explanation of group work • Group work on employment situation analysis and formulation of recommendations • Reporters / group 	ILO (Diane Taieb, Valerie Schmitt, Sukti Dasgupta /Claire Harasty/ Makiko Matsumoto/ Helmut Schwarzer/ Malika Ok) Group work: using “Towards employment security: assessment matrix”

		4 groups per thematic Results: assessment & recommendations Tool used: world café?
15 minutes	PAUSE CAFÉ during group work	
17:15-17:30	Wrap up and closing of the day	Mr. Hou Vudthy (MoLVT) Mr. Helmut Schwarzer (ILO)
Day 2: Thursday 3 November		
Designing and implementing social protection policies and schemes		
07:30-08:00	Registration of participants	
08:00-08:45	Social protection in Asia Q&A	Ms. Valérie Schmitt (ILO)
08:45-09:15	ILO Tools and Activities in Asia - an overview	Ms. Valérie Schmitt (ILO)
09:15-09:45	ILO key conventions and recommendations to serve as a benchmark and to provide guidance in the design of social security schemes and SPF (Convention 102, upcoming recommendation 202, SPF framework) Q&A	Mr. Helmut Schwarzer (ILO)
15 minutes	PAUSE CAFE	
10:00-12:00	Situation analysis and way forward on Social Protection	H.E Sann Vathana (CARD)
	Situation analysis and way forward on: - Employment (TBC) - Social Security of the NSSF - TVET (TBC)	General Department of Labour (MoLVT) & NSSF General Department of TVET (MoLVT)
	Situation analysis and way forward: - Draft Social Security Law (TBC) NSSF (TBC)	Mr. Saneth Vathna (MoSVY) Mr. Mean Vou (NSSF)
1 hour	LUNCH	
13:00-14:00	Situation analysis using diagnostic tools : Presentation of the rapid assessment methodology, experience in Indonesia, Thailand and Viet Nam Relevance for Cambodia/ Scenarios for Social Budget Exercise Q&A	Ms. Valérie Schmitt (ILO) CARD

14:00-16:30	The social protection situation & way forward (design and costing) in Cambodia: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explanation of group work • Group work aiming at identifying some gaps, providing some recommendations and using the simplified costing tool • Reporters / group 	ILO (Diane Taieb, Valerie Schmitt, Helmut Schwarzer, Malika Ok), H.E Sann Vathana (CARD) Group work using “Assessment matrix and simplified version of the RAP costing tool” 4 groups per thematic Results: assessment & recommendations & costing of simplified scenarios Tool used: jeopardy?
15 minutes	PAUSE CAFÉ during the group work	
16:30-17:00	Wrap up and closing of the day	MoSVY & CARD
Day 3: Friday 4 November		
Integrating employment and social protection		
08:00-08:30	Registration of participants	
08:30-09:15	The need for coherence and coordination between employment & social protection, fiscal policy, development policy, societal vision Q&A	Mr. Helmut Schwarzer (ILO)
09:15-09:45	Cambodia’s national social protection strategy (and the linkages with employment) Q&A	H.E Sann Vathana (CARD)
09:45-10:30	Cambodia’s national employment strategy (and the linkages with social protection) Q&A	Ms. Claire Harasty (ILO)
15 minutes	PAUSE CAFE	
10:45-11:30	Open discussion or questions to the floor (need to be prepared in advance) Proper sourcing of Cambodia Social and Employment Policy, Plan for public service to support Social Protection and Employment Policy	ILO Government, workers and employers, development partners
11:30-12:15	Towards an integrated approach: the PEOPLE Service	Ms. Valérie Schmitt (ILO) H.E Sann Vathana (CARD)
1 hour	LUNCH	
13:15-16:00	Designing the PEOPLE Service in different settings	Group work ILO (Diane Taieb, Valerie Schmitt, Helmut Schwarzer, Malika Ok) & H.E Sann Vathana (CARD)
15 minutes	PAUSE CAFE during the group work	
16:00-16:15	Wrap up and closing of the day	CARD
16:15-16:30	Summary of the 3-day training	Mr. Helmut Schwarzer (ILO)